



Iwan A <iwanaflanie73@gmail.com>

[Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine] Submission Acknowledgement

Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine <formed@eco-vector.com>

17 Januari 2024 pukul 15.52

Kepada: iwanaflanie73@gmail.com

Bcc: formed@eco-vector.com

Iwan Aflanie:

Thank you for submitting the manuscript, "Postmortem Characteristics of Drowning Death in Freshwater: A Systematic Review" to Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine. With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Manuscript URL: <https://for-medex.ru/jour/author/submission/16113>

Username: iwanaflanie-73

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Elena A. Philippova
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine

редакция журнала "Судебная медицина"
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team

email: formed@eco-vector.com

WEB: <http://for-medex.ru/>



Iwan A <iwanaflanie73@gmail.com>

[Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine] Editor Decision

Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine <formed@eco-vector.com>

11 Maret 2024 pukul 23.56

Kepada: iwanaflanie73@gmail.com, suhartogete@gmail.com, pandji.winata@ulm.ac.id

Cc: Gusti Muhammad Fuad Suharto <suhartogete@gmail.com>, Pandji Winata Nurikhwan <pandji.winata@ulm.ac.id>

Dear Colleagues!

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine, "Postmortem Characteristics of Drowning Death in Freshwater: A Systematic Review".

Our decision is: **Resubmit**

All reviews are below in the body of the letter.

Elena A. Filippova
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team
+7(965)-012-7072
philippovaea@gmail.com

Reviewer A:

GENERAL EVALUATION

The manuscript text corresponds to its name, as well as the theme of the journal in general

:
Yes

The presented data is actual and relevant for the potential journal readers

:
No

The manuscript is a complete work and the presented data is enough for the article's subject

:
No

The article highlights the new point of view on an actual medical problem

:
No

Describe the text style of the manuscript, its literary and scientific quality, terminological clarity and readability for the target audience
(briefly)

The presented text exhibits low scientific quality due to ambiguously defined objectives (clinical characteristics) and tasks - to investigate postmortem characteristics of drowning in fresh water, without differentiating these characteristics from cases of death in water and submersion of a dead body in water. The authors demonstrate a lack of understanding of fundamental concepts in forensic medicine such as distinguishing between signs of drowning and signs of death in water, as well as changes in the body due to water immersion. Hence, there is an overall flawed approach and results.

- SCORE (4 is a max)

1

The relevance of the review part (briefly)

The total number of drowning fatalities examined in the review is not specified. There is an error in the summary regarding the assumption that the victims were of male gender. Signs such as washerwoman's hands and pink teeth are entirely misinterpreted as specific indicators of drowning (these are indicative of immersion in water). The presence of respiratory tract contamination is also construed as a sign of drowning rather than immersion in water. Paltauf's spots are inaccurately described. Furthermore, in the text, characteristics such as skin maceration and cyanosis of the lips and nails are again described as drowning features, while cardiac dilation is mentioned as an internal characteristic of drowning. At the beginning of the discussion, it is stated that "The mechanism of death by drowning is complicated by the involvement of asphyxia and filling of the airways with fluid, with associated hydrostatic and osmotic effects". Decomposition of the corpse is described without particular comment. Histological examination is mentioned as a means to differentiate drowning from other causes of death, without specifying microscopic characteristics. Once again, washerwoman's hands and pink teeth are highlighted as signs of drowning. The conclusion is brief and entirely unclear, referencing some of the aforementioned erroneous characteristics. Texts are cited with which the authors are not well acquainted (e.g., reference 15), wherein recent studies of the same type compellingly describe entirely different facts. Findings in bodies found in water are confused with drowning characteristics.

- SCORE (4 is a max)

1

Quality of figures and tables (briefly)

The attached figures contain summarized data, but considering the remarks made in the main text, they do not significantly impact the conclusions.

- SCORE (4 is a max)

1

SUMMARY CONCLUSION

:

The presented text addresses a topic initially relevant to forensic medicine, but with an incorrect and flawed approach, resulting in entirely erroneous and misleading conclusions. Recent studies of the same nature provide detailed and scientifically valid findings, rendering this current study devoid of scientific merit and offering no new information.

Reviewer B:**GENERAL EVALUATION**

The manuscript text corresponds to its name, as well as the theme of the journal in general

:

The presented data is actual and relevant for the potential journal readers

:

The manuscript is a complete work and the presented data is enough for the article's subject

:

The article highlights the new point of view on an actual medical problem

:

Describe the text style of the manuscript, its literary and scientific quality, terminological clarity and readability for the target audience

(briefly)

:

- SCORE (4 is a max)

:

The relevance of the review part

(briefly)

:

- SCORE (4 is a max)

:

Quality of figures and tables

(briefly)

:

- SCORE (4 is a max)

:

SUMMARY CONCLUSION

:REVIEW

To the article: Postmortem Characteristics of Drowning Death in Freshwater: A Systematic Review

1. Forensic medical examination of those who died from drowning is relevant, which makes the presented article scientifically and practically significant. The article is an analysis based on a systematic search of the PubMed, Epistemonikos and Cochrane Library databases on clinical, laboratory and other post-mortem characteristics of freshwater drowning deaths. A total of 493 articles were reviewed by the authors, of which 73 were eligible for full-text review and 22 of these met the review inclusion criteria.
2. The material is presented by the authors at a good scientific and methodological level, which makes it possible to publish it in the journal "Forensic Medicine".
3. Graphic materials are presented in sufficient volume. The title of the article fully corresponds to its content.
4. The quality and quantity of literature used by the authors are sufficient and correspond to the title of the article and the research material contained in it.
5. The summary of the article is brief and quite informative.
6. There are no signs of plagiarism or autoplagiarism in the article submitted for review.

Notes.

1. The definition of the term "DROWNING" given by the authors contradicts the definition of "DROWNING" adopted in Russia, according to which "Drowning is a type of death that occurs when a person is completely immersed in water with the development of a number of pathological changes in the vital systems of the body from the complex effects of water on him environment. (Official definition from "Forensic medical substantiation of death from drowning in water" // Letter of the Chief Forensic Expert of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation dated October 13, 1989 No. 2425/01-01) ICD-10 code: T75.1. Therefore, the authors need to point out that there are several points of view on the definition of the term "DROWNING" and focus on the cases that they consider in their article.
2. In their Conclusion, the authors write that "washerwoman's hands" are a sign of drowning - "In conclusion, our study suggests that characteristics associated with drowning death were washerwoman's hand...", which is not true in a number of cases. This sign reflects the presence of the corpse in the water, and, therefore, it is also necessary to pay attention to this.
3. Also, the authors, when analyzing the signs, repeatedly mention the Sveshnikov Sign, which they "forget" in their Conclusion. If the authors believe that this attribute is unimportant, then let them argue for this. Thus, the article submitted by the authors to the scientific and practical journal "Forensic Medicine" corresponds to the profile of the journal and can be published in it after the comments are eliminated.

Conclusion

Publication of an article sent by the authors in the scientific and practical journal "Forensic Medicine" is possible in the "Reviews" section after the comments have been eliminated.

Reviewer C:

GENERAL EVALUATION

The manuscript text corresponds to its name, as well as the theme of the journal in general

:
Yes

The presented data is actual and relevant for the potential journal readers

:
Yes

The manuscript is a complete work and the presented data is enough for the article's subject

:
Yes

The article highlights the new point of view on an actual medical problem

:
Yes

Describe the text style of the manuscript, its literary and scientific quality, terminological clarity and readability for the target audience

(briefly)

:

The style of presentation of the material is scientific, literary and scientifically literate, terminologically clear and readable.

- SCORE (4 is a max)

:

4

The relevance of the review part

(briefly)

:

The style of presentation of the material is scientific, literary and scientifically literate, terminologically clear and readable.

- SCORE (4 is a max)

:

4

Quality of figures and tables

(briefly)

:

The figures and tables are sufficient and clear.

- SCORE (4 is a max)

:

4

SUMMARY CONCLUSION

:

The article needs to be improved.

REVISIONS

The current version of the manuscript **can not be published**, until required revisions will appear:

:

The authors cite signs found during examination of the corpse and associated with drowning and with the corpse being in the water. However, the signs of the corpse being in the water (the hands of the washerwoman and the pink color of the teeth) are indicated by the authors as a sign associated with drowning. Although the object of the authors' research was literary scientific sources, the authors did not delimit these signs in any way, which is methodologically incorrect and the conclusion about the connection between the signs of a corpse being in water and drowning as such may mislead a potential audience.

редакция журнала "Судебная медицина"
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team

email: formed@eco-vector.com

WEB: <http://for-medex.ru/>



Iwan A <iwanaflanie73@gmail.com>

Postmortem Characteristics of Drowning Death in Freshwater: A Systematic Review

Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine <formed@eco-vector.com>

24 Maret 2024 pukul 16.08

Kepada: philippovaea@gmail.com, pandji.winata@ulm.ac.id

Cc: pandji.winata@ulm.ac.id

Bcc: pandji.winata@gmail.com, iwanaflanie73@gmail.com

Dear

Elena A. Filippova
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team

Thank you for the opportunity to revise our manuscript. We have made several changes in the yellow highlight. These are below for some details:

1. The authors in the study result revised by differentiating the characteristics into asphyxia signs, immersion signs, and typical signs of drowning.
2. Asphyxia signs included cyanosis of the lips and bilateral fingernails.
3. The immersion signs included washerwoman's hand, pink teeth, Neil's sign, Svechnikov's sign, Wydler's sign, and debris in the airways.
4. Typical signs of drowning included froth in the airways, emphysema aquosum, and palttauf spots.

I hope our revision met your expectations. Thank you

редакция журнала "Судебная медицина"
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team

email: formed@eco-vector.comWEB: <http://for-medex.ru/>

16113-164368-1-ED (1).docx

7465K



Iwan A <iwanaflanie73@gmail.com>

[Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine] Editor Decision

Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine <formed@eco-vector.com>

22 April 2024 pukul 18.41

Kepada: iwanaflanie73@gmail.com, suhartogete@gmail.com, pandji.winata@ulm.ac.id

Cc: Gusti Muhammad Fuad Suharto <suhartogete@gmail.com>, Pandji Winata Nurikhwan <pandji.winata@ulm.ac.id>

Dear Colleagues!

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine, "Postmortem Characteristics of Drowning Death in Freshwater: A Systematic Review".

Our decision is to: **Accept Submission.**

All peer reviews are in this letter below.

Kindly remind you to pay for the publication of your manuscript. For all payment questions, please contact Sergey Mylnikov s.mylnikoff@eco-vector.com

Elena A. Filippova
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team
+7(965)-012-7072
philippovaea@gmail.com

Reviewer B:

GENERAL EVALUATION

The manuscript text corresponds to its name, as well as the theme of the journal in general

:
Yes

The presented data is actual and relevant for the potential journal readers

:
Yes

The manuscript is a complete work and the presented data is enough for the article's subject

:
Yes

The article highlights the new point of view on an actual medical problem

:
Yes

Describe the text style of the manuscript, its literary and scientific quality, terminological clarity and readability for the target audience

(briefly)

:

The presentation style is scientific, overview, literary and scientifically literate, terminologically clear and readable.

- SCORE (4 is a max)

:

4

The relevance of the review part

(briefly)

:

sufficient.

- SCORE (4 is a max)

:

4

Quality of figures and tables

(briefly)

:

sufficient, readable.

- SCORE (4 is a max)

:

4

SUMMARY CONCLUSION

:

The current version of the manuscript may be published.

редакция журнала "Судебная медицина"
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team

email: formed@eco-vector.com

WEB: <http://for-medex.ru/>



Iwan A <iwanaflanie73@gmail.com>

[Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine] Copyediting Review Request

Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine <formed@eco-vector.com>
Kepada: iwanaflanie73@gmail.com

26 April 2024 pukul 22.36

Dear Colleagues!

Your submission "**Postmortem Characteristics of Drowning Death in Freshwater: A Systematic Review**" for *Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine* has been through the first step of copyediting, and is available for you to review by following these steps.

1. Click on the Submission URL below.
2. Log into the journal and click on the File that appears in Step 1.
3. Open the downloaded submission.
4. Review the text, including copyediting proposals and Author Queries.
5. Make any copyediting changes that would further improve the text.
6. When completed, upload the file in Step 2.
7. Click on METADATA to check indexing information for completeness and accuracy.
8. Send the COMPLETE email to the editor and copyeditor.

Submission URL: <https://for-medex.ru/jour/author/submissionEditing/16113>
Username: iwanaflanie-73


This is the last opportunity to make substantial copyediting changes to the submission. The proofreading stage, that follows the preparation of the galleys, is restricted to correcting typographical and layout errors.

If you are unable to undertake this work at this time or have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for your contribution to this journal.

Elena A. Filippova
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team
+7(965)-012-7072
philippovaea@gmail.com

редакция журнала "Судебная медицина"
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team

email: formed@eco-vector.com
WEB: <http://for-medex.ru/>

 **Aflanie_Forensic_2-2024_final.docx**
151K



Iwan A <iwanaflanie73@gmail.com>

[Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine] Copyediting Review Completed

Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine <formed@eco-vector.com>

12 Mei 2024 pukul 16.14

Керда: philippovaea@gmail.com

Сс: Елена Филиппова <philippovaea@gmail.com>

Всс: pandji.winata@ulm.ac.id, iwanaflanie73@gmail.com

Elena Andreevna Filippova:

I have now reviewed the copyediting of the manuscript, "Postmortem Characteristics of Drowning Death in Freshwater: A Systematic Review," for Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine, and it is ready for the final round of copyediting and preparation for Layout.

Thank you for this contribution to my work,
Iwan Aflanie

редакция журнала "Судебная медицина"
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team

email: formed@eco-vector.com

WEB: <http://for-medex.ru/>



Iwan A <iwanaflanie73@gmail.com>

[Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine] Copyediting Review Acknowledgement

Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine <formed@eco-vector.com>
Kepada: iwanaflanie73@gmail.com

17 Mei 2024 pukul 21.28

Dear Iwan Aflanie!

Thank you for reviewing the copyediting of your manuscript, "Postmortem Characteristics of Drowning Death in Freshwater: A Systematic Review," for Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine. We look forward to publishing this work.

Elena A. Filippova
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team
+7(965)-012-7072
philippovaea@gmail.com

редакция журнала "Судебная медицина"
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team

email: formed@eco-vector.com
WEB: <http://for-medex.ru/>



Iwan A <iwanaflanie73@gmail.com>

[Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine] Proofreading Request (Author)

Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine <formed@eco-vector.com>
Kepada: iwanaflanie73@gmail.com

17 Juni 2024 pukul 22.01

Dear Iwan Aflanie!

Your submission "**Postmortem Characteristics of Drowning Death in Freshwater: A Systematic Review**" to Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine now **needs to be proofread** (**the layout is in attachment to the letter**) by following these steps.

1. Click on the Submission URL below.
2. Log into the journal and view PROOFING INSTRUCTIONS
3. Click on VIEW PROOF in Layout and proof the galley in the one or more formats used.
4. Enter corrections (typographical and format) in Proofreading Corrections.
5. Save and email corrections to Layout Editor and Proofreader.
6. Send the COMPLETE email to the editor.

Kindly remind you to insert ORCIDs to your co-authors necessarily! If your co-authors have no ORCIDs yet, they should register on orcid.org and get ORCID ID. This identifier is necessary for publication.

Submission URL: <https://for-medex.ru/jour/author/submissionEditing/16113>
Username: iwanaflanie-73

Elena Andreevna Filippova
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team
+7(965)-012-7072
philippovaea@gmail.com

редакция журнала "Судебная медицина"
Russian Journal of Forensic Medicine editorial team

email: formed@eco-vector.com
WEB: <http://for-medex.ru/>

 **Aflanie_ENG.pdf**
646K