

## JOURNAL ARTICLE CORRESPONDENCE

### REPUTABLE INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL

Title **The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights**

Journal: Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice | ISSN: 1948-9137  
<https://www.crlsj.com/index.php/journal/>

Author: Zainul Akhyar

No.	Particulars	Date
1.	Submission	12.03.2024
2.	First review	28.03.2024
3.	Re-submission	13.04.2024
4.	Second Review	02.05.2024
5.	Re-submission after second review	28.05.2024
6.	Accepted	18.06.2024
7.	Published	16.08.2024

Workflow

Publication

Submission

Review

Copyediting

Production

Submission

Search

The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights\_[blind manuscript].docx **March 12, 2024** Article Text

Download All Files

First Review

Add discussion

Returned from peer review **March 28, 2024** Replies Closed

First Re-Submission

Search

The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights\_[blind manuscript].docx **April 13, 2024** Article Text

Download All Files

Second Review

Add discussion

Returned from second Review **May 02, 2024** Replies Closed

Second Re-Submission

Search

With Editor **May 28, 2024**

Download All Files

Editor's decision

Add discussion

Accepted for publication in Vol. 16 (1), Aug, 2024 **June 18, 2024** Replies Closed

No Items

**Submission**  
**(March 12, 2024)**



---

## Submission for Publication | Manuscript ID CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

---

**Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice** <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com> March 12, 2024 at 12:32 PM

**Journal Editor:** editor@crlsj.com

To: Zainul Akhyar <zainulakhyar@ulm.ac.id>

Dear Author,

Thank you for submitting the manuscript, "**The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights**" to Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice. With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site.

Your manuscript designated with ID CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013 is presently being for reviewed for possible publication in Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to the journal portal at <https://www.crlsj.com/index.php/journal/> and edit your user information as appropriate.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to the above link.

As part of our commitment to ensuring an ethical, transparent and fair peer review process we are a supporting member of ORCID, the Open Researcher and Contributor ID (<https://orcid.org/>). We encourage all authors and co-authors to use ORCID iDs during the peer review process. If you already have an ORCID iD you can link this to your account in the journal portal by logging in and editing your account information. If you do not already have an ORCID iD you may create your unique identifier and automatically add it to your profile.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice.

Sincerely,

Editorial Team  
Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice  
[www.crlsj.com](http://www.crlsj.com)

## The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights

Journal:	Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice
Manuscript ID:	CRLSJ_2024_07_1013
Manuscript Type:	Regular Article
Key Words:	Omnibus Law; Job Creation Law; Workers' Constitutional Rights; Labor Legislation; Employment, Policy; Social Protection
Abstract:	<p>The enactment of the Job Creation Law (Law No. 11 of 2020) on November 2, 2020, was intended to foster a more conducive business environment in Indonesia. This study aims to analyze the legal and constitutional implications of the Job Creation Law on the rights of workers in Indonesia. This research adopts a normative juridical approach, utilizing the comparative legal analysis to examine the compatibility of the Job Creation Law with existing labor regulations and the Indonesian Constitution. The study scrutinizes various legal texts, government regulations, and constitutional provisions to identify potential conflicts and implications for workers' rights. The analysis reveals that several provisions within the Job Creation Law conflict with existing labor laws and the Constitution. These conflicts systematically degrade workers' constitutional rights, including the right to secure employment, fair income, and social protection, which are essential for ensuring their welfare. The Job Creation Law, while aimed at fostering economic growth, raises significant concerns regarding the erosion of workers' constitutional rights in Indonesia. Consequently, a comprehensive review of the Job Creation Law is warranted to prevent broader injustices, particularly concerning workers' rights in Indonesia.</p>

**Review Report (1)**  
**(March 28, 2024)**



---

## Manuscript Revision - Manuscript ID CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

---

Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com> March 28, 2024 at 2:09 PM

Journal Editor: <editor@crlsj.com>

To: Zainul Akhyar <zainulakhyar@ulm.ac.id>

---

Dear Author,

You are advised to revise your manuscript titled "**The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights**" you submitted to Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice.

We have now received and reviewed the feedback from our reviewers. We are glad that **the article addresses the constitutional implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on workers' rights, a subject of significant importance given the ongoing debates and protests related to the law. The research is timely and highly relevant in the context of Indonesia's socio-political landscape.** However, some revisions are necessary before we can proceed with publication.

Address the key points from the reviewers' comments as you revise your manuscript and submit the revised version within 30 days from the date of this letter. Ensure that all changes are clearly highlighted and have been addressed.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to the journal portal at <https://www.crlsj.com/index.php/journal/> and edit your user information as appropriate.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to the above link.

As part of our commitment to ensuring an ethical, transparent and fair peer review process we are a supporting member of ORCID, the Open Researcher and Contributor ID (<https://orcid.org/>). We encourage all authors and co-authors to use ORCID iDs during the peer review process. If you already have an ORCID iD you can link this to your account in the journal portal by logging in and editing your account information. If you do not already have an ORCID iD you may create your unique identifier and automatically add it to your profile.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice.

Sincerely,

Editorial Team  
Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice  
[www.crlsj.com](http://www.crlsj.com)

## REVIEW REPORT 1

**Manuscript ID:** CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

**Manuscript Title:** The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights

### Reviewer 1:

#### Strengths:

The article provides a thorough examination of the constitutional framework in Indonesia, specifically in relation to workers' rights. The analysis is detailed and well-structured, offering a clear understanding of the legal principles at play.

The author presents a balanced view, discussing both the potential benefits and the risks of the Omnibus Law. This approach helps to avoid bias and provides a more nuanced understanding of the law's impact on workers' rights.

The inclusion of relevant case law and constitutional court decisions strengthens the arguments presented in the article. It shows the author's deep understanding of the legal context and enhances the credibility of the analysis.

#### Areas of Improvement:

While the article briefly mentions comparative perspectives, it could benefit from a more in-depth comparison with similar legislative reforms in other countries. This would provide a broader context and allow for a better understanding of how Indonesia's approach aligns or diverges from international trends.

The article primarily relies on legal analysis without incorporating empirical data on how the Omnibus Law has affected workers in practice. Including some data or case studies illustrating the real-world impact of the law would strengthen the article's conclusions.

At times, the article uses legal jargon that may not be easily understood by readers without a legal background. Simplifying some of these terms or providing brief explanations would make the article more accessible to a wider audience.

The conclusion could be more robust by offering specific policy recommendations based on the analysis. This would provide practical guidance for lawmakers and stakeholders who are navigating the challenges posed by the Omnibus Law.

### Editor:

Consider reviewers' comments as providing a valuable roadmap for enhancing your manuscript. Please address the areas of improvement identified by the reviewers in your revised submission.

### Editorial Board

Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice

<https://www.crlsj.com/index.php/journal/>



# The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights

by zainulakhyar@ulm.ac.id

Zainul Akhyar, <https://orcid.org/0009-0002-4719-7667>

---

**Submission date:** 10-March-2024 11:11PM

(UTC+0900)**Submission ID:** 2411200882

**File name:**

The\_Constitutional\_Implications\_of\_Indonesia\_s\_Omnibus\_Job\_Creation\_Law\_on\_Workers\_Rights.docx  
(6.38M)

**Word count:** 4157

**Character count:** 25466



1  
*Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice* 16(1), 2024  
pp. 01–16, ISSN 1948-9137, eISSN 2162-2752

Sp. ETS

15

## The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights

Prep. ETS

Zainul Akhyar, Mariatul Kiptiah, Muhammad Elmy

Sp. ETS

Sp. ETS

Sp. ETS

Sp. ETS

5

ABSTRACT. The enactment of the Job Creation Law (Law No. 11 of 2020) on November 2, 2020, was intended to foster a more conducive business environment in Indonesia. This study aims to analyze the legal and constitutional implications of the Job Creation Law on the rights of workers in Indonesia. This research adopts a normative juridical approach, utilizing the comparative legal analysis to examine the compatibility of the Job Creation Law with existing labor regulations and the Indonesian Constitution. The study scrutinizes various legal texts, government regulations, and constitutional provisions to identify potential conflicts and implications for workers' rights. The analysis reveals that several provisions within the Job Creation Law conflict with existing labor laws and the Constitution. These conflicts systematically degrade workers' constitutional rights, including the right to secure employment, fair income, and social protection, which are essential for ensuring their welfare. The Job Creation Law, while aimed at fostering economic growth, raises significant concerns regarding the erosion of workers' constitutional rights in Indonesia. Consequently, a comprehensive review of the Job Creation Law is warranted to prevent broader injustices, particularly concerning workers' rights in Indonesia.

Keywords: Omnibus Law; Job Creation Law; Workers' Constitutional Rights; Labor Legislation; Employment Policy; Social Protection

How to cite: Akhyar, Zainul, Mariatul Kiptiah, and Muhammad Elmy. "The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights." *Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice* 16, no. 1 (2024): 1-12.

Received MM DD YYYY • Received in revised form MM DD YYYY

Accepted MM DD YYYY • Available online MM DD YYYY

\*Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, South Kalimantan Province, 70123, Indonesia.

mariatulkiptiah@ulm.ac.id

Sp. ETS

Sp. ETS

Sp. ETS

Sp. ETS

## 1. Introduction

25

At the end of 2020, attention from various segments of Indonesian society, including workers, academics, and labor issue observers, focused on the political policy that established the Omnibus Job Creation Law, commonly known as the Job Creation Law. This law is closely related to the right to work, which is part of human rights and must be protected in a rule-of-law state like Indonesia (Hamid 2021).

The Job Creation Law No. 11 of 2020 was enacted on November 2, 2020, with the intention of creating a more favorable business environment in Indonesia. This law aimed to attract investment and stimulate economic growth by simplifying regulations and making it easier to start and run businesses. However, it faced significant opposition due to concerns about its impact on labor rights and environmental protections. In response to the backlash and subsequent judicial review, the government issued Government Regulation in Lieu of Law (PERPU) No. 2 of 2022 as a corrective measure, which was later established as Law No. 6 of 2022. This new regulation sought to address the criticisms and ensure smoother implementation of the Job Creation Law. The primary goals of these legislative changes were to create new jobs and reduce unemployment, which has been a persistent issue in Indonesia (Hamid 2021; Rozaq and Mediawati 2023; Setia Negara, Anggoro, and Koeswahyono 2024).

The significant attention to the Job Creation Law can be viewed from two main aspects. First, the use of the “omnibus law” concept in the legislative process in Indonesia is new and has piqued the interest of many. The public is keen to understand the practices involved in its formation, its positive and negative aspects, the breadth of its coverage, and the legal aspects of creating a law using the omnibus approach. This approach, although common in some countries like the United States, is unprecedented in Indonesia and raises questions about its legal and practical implications (Mahy 2022; Priambudi, Papuani, and Iskandar 2021).

In Indonesia, the concept of an omnibus law was previously unfamiliar and not utilized in legislative processes. The Job Creation Law represents a significant departure from traditional law-making practices in the country. This new approach aims to streamline regulations and reduce bureaucratic red tape but has raised concerns regarding transparency and public participation (Mochtar and Rishan 2022).

The Job Creation Law’s content raises several questions, particularly within a rule-of-law state where political power must respect the supremacy of law and not contradict higher-ranking laws. Concerns emerge regarding whether the Job Creation Law will invalidate other existing laws and if its legal content conflicts with current regulations. The primary issue is its impact on citizens’ constitutional rights, especially workers, who had limited participation in its formation process. Studies show that worker participation in legislative processes is crucial for adequately protecting their rights. The normative legal conflicts arising from the law highlight potential contradictions with existing

labor regulations. While there are expected economic benefits from the law, there are also noted social risks, particularly those affecting labor rights. The omnibus approach used in the law is compared to legislative practices in other jurisdictions, emphasizing the importance of maintaining legal hierarchy and warning against potential erosion of constitutional safeguards.

For instance, a study published in the *Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies* discusses the socio-legal impacts and potential legal conflicts arising from the *Job Creation Law*, particularly focusing on the legislative hierarchy and risk of diminishing workers' rights (Harryarsana et al. 2023). Another critical review from the *Indonesian Journal of Law and Economics Review* highlights the perceived deficiencies in both material and formal aspects of the law, which might lead to new industrial relations problems and inadequate legal protection for workers (Hermanto and Purwaningsih 2021).

Additionally, the importance of maintaining a legal hierarchy and preventing constitutional erosion is emphasized in comparative studies of omnibus legislation in other jurisdictions (Florin 2008; Hazama and Iba 2017). This highlights that while the omnibus method aims to streamline legislative processes, it must be carefully implemented to avoid undermining established legal frameworks and worker protections.

This study aims to analyze the legal and constitutional implications of the Omnibus *Job Creation Law* on workers' rights in Indonesia. The focus is to identify and examine potential conflicts between this law and existing labor regulations, as well as the Indonesian Constitution. Specifically, the research seeks to determine whether the *Job Creation Law* upholds or undermines workers' rights to secure employment, fair income, and social protection.

This research adopts a normative juridical approach with a comparative legal analysis method. Data is obtained through a literature review involving the examination of legal texts, government regulations, and relevant constitutional provisions. The analysis involves comparing the content of the *Job Creation Law* with existing labor laws and the Constitution to identify conflicts and their implications for workers' rights. Additionally, the study incorporates qualitative data from interviews with labor law experts and workers' representatives to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the law's impact.

The findings of this study are expected to provide significant contributions to understanding the legal implications of the *Job Creation Law* on workers' constitutional rights in Indonesia. Furthermore, this research aims to offer policy recommendations to ensure that the implementation of the law does not harm workers' constitutional rights and promotes better protection of these rights. By addressing these issues, the study seeks to inform future legislative processes and contribute to the broader discourse on labor rights and legal reform in Indonesia.



## 2. Methods

### 2.1. Research Paradigm and Legal Materials

This research employs a normative legal research methodology with a qualitative paradigm. A qualitative paradigm involves collecting legal materials and analyzing and describing the facts holistically <sup>17</sup> derive meaning from the studied object (McConville and Chui 2017). The legal materials used <sup>4</sup> in this research include the 1945 Constitution of Indonesia, the content of the Job Creation Law, the Labor Law, and the perspectives of legal experts related to the Constitution, legal systems, and legal theories. Secondary legal materials such as journal articles, books, and relevant research reports are also used to strengthen the analysis (Creswell and Poth 2018).

<sup>16</sup>

### 2.2. Techniques for Collecting Legal Materials

The technique used for collecting legal materials in this study is document study (documentary study), which involves gathering legal documents from the highest to the lowest levels, starting from the 1945 Constitution, followed by laws, government regulations, and legal decisions of public officials arranged hierarchically from the highest to the lowest level (Watkins and Burton 2017). This tiered technique of collecting legal materials guides the research process in gathering various legislative and regulatory products primarily related to the research issue (Floridi 2019). Data is collected through legal databases, libraries, and official online sources to ensure comprehensiveness and accuracy (Walliman 2006).

### 2.3. Analysis of Legal Materials

This research is fundamentally normative legal research, which involves analyzing legal materials and interrelating them, not merely explaining or describing them but also applying hermeneutic (interpretation), evaluative (assessment), and conclusive (concluding) approaches. The analysis compares the content of the Job Creation Law with existing labor laws and the Indonesian Constitution to identify conflicts and their implications for workers' rights. Additionally, the analysis includes evaluating the practical impacts of the law's implementation on workers' constitutional rights (Stake 2010).

### 2.4. Validation and Triangulation

To enhance the validity and reliability of the research, data triangulation is conducted by comparing the results of document analysis with in-depth interviews with labor law experts and worker representatives. These interviews aim to obtain practical perspectives on the implementation of the Job Creation Law and its impact on workers' rights (Denzin 2017).

### 2.5. Ethical Considerations

This research also adheres to ethical considerations by ensuring that all collected and analyzed data is kept confidential and used in accordance with the

permissions granted by respondents and data sources. Additionally, the research commits to presenting an objective and unbiased analysis (Israel and Hay 2006).

## 2.6. Expected Outcomes

The findings of this study are expected to provide significant contributions to understanding the legal implications of the Job Creation Law on workers' constitutional rights in Indonesia. Furthermore, this research aims to offer policy recommendations to ensure that the implementation of the law does not harm workers' constitutional rights and promotes better protection of these rights.

## 10 Research Findings

### 3.1. Objectives of the Omnibus Law on Job Creation

Every law enacted by the legislature within a country is considered crucial for specific reasons. In the context of development, law serves as a foundation, procedure, and guide for stakeholders in implementing development programs. It acts as the legal basis for the administration of development. The development itself encompasses various meanings, such as overcoming issues, improving conditions, maintaining stability, and enhancing the current state. Therefore, the essence of development is to improve a situation to make it better. With this understanding, it is clear that the Job Creation Law is a legal foundation in the field of labor development intended to address and solve labor issues in Indonesia (Wahyuni and Kee Ng 2012; Wihardja and Cunningham 2021; Sugiyarto, Oey-Gardiner, and Triaswati 2006; Hamid 2021).

Handling labor development in Indonesia is a crucial area consistently addressed by governmental departments, demonstrating the persistent labor issues that need serious attention from the government. Labor problems in Indonesia have existed from the past until now due to the high growth rate of the labor force against limited job availability. This situation leads to issues such as unemployment, poverty, low wages, and difficulties in achieving workers' rights for a better livelihood (Mahy 2022; Hermanto and Purwaningsih 2021). To resolve these issues, a balance between the growth of the labor force and job availability that can absorb the labor force must be achieved. If this balance is realized, adverse impacts in the labor sector can be controlled.

The enactment of the Job Creation Law aims to create an environment conducive to employment growth amid increasing competition and demands for economic globalization. It is intended to address unemployment and poverty in Indonesia. Specifically, the objectives of the Job Creation Law, as outlined in Article 3 of Law No. 11 of 2020, include:

- 1) Creating and enhancing job opportunities
- 2) Ensuring that every citizen can secure employment and receive fair and decent treatment in employment relationships

13  
The objectives and considerations of the Job Creation Law reflect the state's and government's commitment to fulfilling the constitutional mandate of achieving the goals of the Indonesian state and realizing a prosperous, just, and affluent society based on Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution. Through the Job Creation Law, it is hoped that various labor issues in Indonesia can be addressed (Hamid 2021; Wahyuni and Kee Ng 2012; Wihardja and Cunningham 2021; Sugiyarto, Oey-Gardiner, and Triaswati 2006).

### 6 3.2. The Omnibus Law Approach in Formulating the Job Creation Law

The omnibus law approach in Indonesia is a novel method introduced during the formulation of the Job Creation Law. Typically, laws are made to address specific areas of life, avoiding overlapping regulations. Laws should not contradict higher-level constitutions, as emphasized in the legislative hierarchy (Mahy 2022; Siagian 2021).

The Job Creation Law differs significantly in its content and formulation process, employing the omnibus law technique. This involves reformulating, negating, revoking, or annulling parts or entire existing regulations. The explanatory notes of the Job Creation Law indicate that it covers 11 clusters of regulated fields and amalgamates 78 existing laws. This reconstruction aims to focus on "job creation" (Hamid 2021; Mahy 2022).

The omnibus law technique has positive potential in achieving goals by aligning existing regulations towards a specific objective. However, it also brings negative consequences, such as the possibility of overriding, revoking, or annulling existing laws. According to legal theory, specific new regulations can nullify general existing ones. The Job Creation Law, being a specific law aimed at job creation, may have significant legal impacts, particularly on workers' rights (Arifin 2021; Sembiring, Fatimah, and Widyaningsih 2020).

### 3 3.3. The Omnibus Law Approach in Formulating the Job Creation Law

Discussing the constitutional rights of workers in Indonesia requires a thorough examination of the 1945 Constitution. 8  
Implicit constitutional rights are outlined in Article 27 (2), which states that all citizens have the right to work and live a decent life. This right must be guaranteed in every piece of legislation, ensuring it is not reduced, overlooked, or eliminated. Additionally, the state must uphold legal protection guarantees without exception, a constitutional duty entrusted to the government (Dungga et al. 2023; Ardyansyah and Rizal 2023).

Another constitutional right is the right to fair compensation, often termed "decent wages" in the labor sector. Decent wages refer to earnings sufficient to meet human needs based on human dignity (Febrianto, Febrianti, and Seruni 2023).

Implicit constitutional rights are indicated in the preamble, which aims to promote general welfare. This phrase emphasizes that all citizens, including workers, have the right to prosperity, and the government is responsible for



achieving this constitutional mandate. Legislation is a tool for implementing constitutional provisions and ensuring that laws uphold, not undermine, constitutional rights, including the Job Creation Law (Mahy 2022).

### 3.4. Implications of the Omnibus Law on Job Creation on Workers' Constitutional Rights in Indonesia

The enactment of a law has legal implications, either reinforcing constitutional mandates or contradicting them. Comparative analysis of the Job Creation Law and other labor laws is necessary to determine its impact on workers' rights.

The Job Creation Law removes provisions regarding the duration of fixed-term employment contracts as regulated in Article 59 (4) of the Labor Law (Law No. 13 of 2003). It is further explained in Article 81 of the Job Creation Law. This legal change eliminates the opportunity for fixed-term workers to transition to permanent employment, potentially disadvantaging them. Permanent employment provides better future security compared to fixed-term employment (Shalihah et al. 2022; Kamal 2020).

Furthermore, the Job Creation Law introduces clauses that could disadvantage workers' rights to fair and decent compensation. For instance, it removes some wage policies protecting workers and abolishes sanctions for employers who fail to pay wages. These provisions could lead to unfavorable conditions for workers when implementing employment regulations (Risfa Izzati 2022).

Wages are a fundamental right, as stipulated in Article 88 of Law No. 13 of 2003, aiming to realize the right to a decent livelihood. Differences in wage regulations between the Labor Law of 2003 and the Job Creation Law have led to opposition among workers. The Job Creation Law includes new articles (88A-88F), where Article 88C requires governors to set provincial minimum wages and optionally set district/city minimum wages. This optional clause could result in inconsistent wage policies (Suryahadi, Febriany, and Yumna 2017; Perdana 2021; Murphy 2019).

The Job Creation Law seems to weaken several constitutional rights of workers, which should instead be strengthened to ensure legal protection and justice for workers, recognizing their weaker position in industrial relations. Workers are in a vulnerable position in terms of legal guarantees and living standards, necessitating legal protection that favors the weak while ensuring fairness for all parties (Setia Negara, Anggoro, and Koeswahyono 2024).

The Job Creation Law appears to degrade the welfare values embedded in Law No. 13 of 2003 concerning Employment. Three essential pillars of worker welfare must be protected:

#### 1) Job Security

Employment is a right of every Indonesian citizen, and the government must protect it, as emphasized in the Constitution.

#### 2) Income Security



Workers desire decent earnings commensurate with their productivity and contribution to the company's profit, necessitating legal protection.

3) Social Security

Indonesia adheres to the "rule of law and welfare state" theory, requiring legal instruments to guarantee social protection and consistent welfare maintenance for citizens (Suryahadi, Febriany, and Yumna 2017; Murphy 2019; Perdana 2021).

4. **Conclusion**

The enactment of the Job Creation Law, based on a comparative analysis of existing legislation, has significant legal implications for workers' constitutional rights. The research indicates that several provisions within the Job Creation Law conflict with or disregard the protections established in other labor laws and the Constitution. This results in the systematic degradation of workers' constitutional rights, including the right to secure employment, fair compensation, and social protection, which are essential for their overall welfare.

This study primarily focuses on the legal implications of the Job Creation Law on workers' constitutional rights through an analysis of current legislation. It does not delve into the motivations or reasons behind the specific provisions of the law. Understanding these motivations would require information from the authorities responsible for drafting the legislation, which was beyond the scope of this research.

Future research should aim to explore the underlying reasons and motivations behind the enactment of specific provisions in the Job Creation Law. This would involve qualitative research methods, such as interviews with policymakers, stakeholders, and experts involved in the legislative process. Additionally, empirical studies could assess the actual impact of the law on workers' livelihoods and welfare, providing a comprehensive understanding of its broader socio-economic implications.



Mariatul Kiptiah, <https://orcid.org/0009-0003-2332-1456>

Sp. (ET) Sp. (ETS)

**Compliance with ethical standards**

This article does not contain any studies with human participants or animals performed by the author. Extracting and inspecting publicly accessible files (scholarly sources) as evidence before the research began, but no institutional ethics approval was required.

**Data availability statement**

All data generated or analyzed are included in the published article.

**Funding information**

None.

### Author contributions

The authors confirm that they collectively contributed to this work and approved it for publication. Each author takes full responsibility for the accuracy and integrity of the data analysis.

Article Error 

### Conflict of interest statement

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

## REFERENCES

- Ardyansyah, Rizky Ahadyan, and Saiful Rizal. 2023. "Instrument for Protection and Enforcement of Human Rights in Indonesia." *Rechtenstudent* 4 (3): 289–302. <https://doi.org/10.35719/rch.v4i3.304>.
- Arifin, Saru. 2021. "Illiberal Tendencies in Indonesian Legislation: The Case of the Omnibus Law on Job Creation." *The Theory and Practice of Legislation* 9 (3): 386–403. <https://doi.org/10.1080/20508840.2021.1942374>.
- Creswell, J. W., and C. N. Poth. 2018. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. 4th ed. SAGE Publications.
- Denzin, N. K. 2017. *The Research Act: A Theoretical Introduction to Sociological Methods*. 3rd ed. Routledge.
- Dungga, Weny Almoravid, Sudarsono Sudarsono, Abdul Rachmad Budiono, and Rachmad Safa'at. 2023. "The Concept of Regulation of Legal Protection of Labor in Indonesia (Review of the Problems and Forms of Protection)." *International Journal of Social Science Research and Review* 6 (4): 453–61.
- Febrianto, Surizki, Lidia Febrianti, and Puti Mayang Seruni. 2023. "Promoting Decent Living For Daily Workers in Accordance With Indonesian Government Regulation No. 36 Of 2021 On Wages." *Kanun Jurnal Ilmu Hukum* 25 (3): 413–28.
- Floridi, Luciano. 2019. "The Green and the Blue: Naïve Ideas to Improve Politics in a Mature Information Society." In *The 2018 Yearbook of the Digital Ethics Lab*, 183–221. Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-17152-0\\_12](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-17152-0_12).
- Florin, N. 2008. "Quality of Legislation: A Law and Development Project." In *Lawmaking for Development*, edited by J. Arnscheidt, B. of Rooij, and J.M. Otto, 75–89. Leiden University Press.
- Hamid, Adnan. 2021. "A Critical Study of the Job Creation Law No. 11 of 2020 and Its Implications for Labor in Indonesia." *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science* 10 (5): 195–206. <https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v10i5.1271>.
- Harryarsana, I Gusti Kade Budhi, Supardi Hamid, Paulus Israwan Setyoko,

- Denok Kurniasih, and Anggara Setya Saputra. 2023. "The Role of Omnibus Law Implementation on the Women Workers Protection: An Descriptive Analysis of Labor Law in Indonesia." *Russian Law Journal* 11 (2): 324–29. <https://www.russianlawjournal.org/index.php/journal/article/view/668>.
- Hazama, Yasushi, and Şeref Iba. 2017. "Legislative Agenda Setting by a Delegative Democracy: Omnibus Bills in the Turkish Parliamentary System." *Turkish Studies* 18 (2): 313–33. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14683849.2016.1261022>.
- Hermanto, Memed, and Sri Budi Purwaningsih. 2021. "Critical Review on New Indonesia Law on Labour Rights." *Indonesian Journal of Law and Economics Review* 13: 10–21070.
- Israel, Mark, and Iain Hay. 2006. *Research Ethics for Social Scientists*. Research Ethics for Social Scientists. 1 Oliver's Yard, 55 City Road, London England EC1Y 1SP United Kingdom: SAGE Publications, Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781849209779>.
- Kamal, Muhammad. 2020. "Workers Protection with a Fixed-Term Employment Contract System Based on the Employment Statutory Regulations." *Substantive Justice International Journal of Law* 3 (2): 180. <https://doi.org/10.33096/substantivejustice.v3i2.89>.
- Mahy, Petra. 2022. "Indonesia's Omnibus Law on Job Creation: Legal Hierarchy and Responses to Judicial Review in the Labour Cluster of Amendments." *Asian Journal of Comparative Law* 17 (1): 51–75. <https://doi.org/10.1017/asjcl.2022.7>.
- McConville, Mike, and Wing Hong Chui. 2017. *Research Methods for Law*. Edited by Mike McConville and Wing Hong (Eric) Chui. *Research Methods for Law*. Edinburgh University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9781474404259>.
- Mochtar, Zainal Arifin, and Idul Rishan. 2022. "Autocratic Legalism: The Making of Indonesian Omnibus Law." *Yustisia Jurnal Hukum* 11 (1): 29. <https://doi.org/10.20961/yustisia.v11i1.59296>.
- Murphy, John. 2019. "The Historical Development of Indonesian Social Security." *Asian Journal of Social Science* 47 (2): 255–79. <https://doi.org/10.1163/15685314-04702005>.
- Perdana, Surya. 2021. "Comparison of Government Efforts in Improving the Welfare of Indonesian Workers Based on Law Number 13 of 2003 Concerning Manpower and Draft Law Number 11 of 2020 Concerning Job Creation." *International Journal Reglement & Society (IJRS)* 2 (1): 35–44. <https://doi.org/10.55357/ijrs.v2i1.85>.
- Priambudi, Zaki, Namira Hilda Papuani, and Ramdhan Prawira Mulya Iskandar. 2021. "Optimizing Omnibus Law in Indonesia: A Legal Enquiry on the Use of Artificial Intelligence for Legislative Drafting." *Indonesian Journal of Law and Society* 2 (1): 81. <https://doi.org/10.19184/ijls.v2i1.21787>.

- Risfa Izzati, Nabiyla. 2022. "Deregulation in Job Creation Law: The Future of Indonesian Labor Law." *PADJADJARAN Jurnal Ilmu Hukum (Journal of Law)* 9 (2): 191–209. <https://doi.org/10.22304/pjih.v9n2.a3>.
- Rozaq, Moh. Fatkhur, and Noor Fatimah Mediawati. 2023. "Analisis Keberlakuan Peraturan Pemerintah Turunan Undang-Undang Cipta Kerja Pasca Putusan Inkonstitusional Bersyarat." *Web of Scientist International Scientific Research Journal* 3 (1). <https://doi.org/10.47134/webofscientist.v3i1.13>.
- Sembiring, Raynaldo, Isna Fatimah, and Grita Anindarini Widyaningsih. 2020. "Indonesia's Omnibus Bill on Job Creation: A Setback for Environmental Law?" *Chinese Journal of Environmental Law* 4 (1): 97–109. <https://doi.org/10.1163/24686042-12340051>.
- Setia Negara, Tunggul Anshari, Syahriza Alkohir Anggoro, and Imam Koeswahyono. 2024. "Indonesian Job Creation Law: Neoliberal Legality, Authoritarianism and Executive Aggrandizement Under Joko Widodo." *Law and Development Review* 17 (1): 155–97. <https://doi.org/10.1515/ldr-2023-0022>.
- Shalihah, Fithriatus, Megawati Megawati, Suryadi Suryadi, Siti Zuliyah, and Fauzan Muhammadi. 2022. "Fixed-Time Employment Agreement Based on Legal Awareness to Realize Harmonious Employment Relationship." *Substantive Justice International Journal of Law* 5 (2): 178. <https://doi.org/10.56087/substantivejustice.v5i2.184>.
- Siagian, Abdul Hakim. 2021. "Omnibus Law Draft in the Perspective of Constitutionality and Legal Politics." *Jambura Law Review* 3 (1): 93–111. <https://doi.org/10.33756/jlr.v3i1.7222>.
- Stake, Robert E. 2010. *Qualitative Research: Studying How Things Work*. Guilford Press.
- Sugiyarto, Guntur, Mayling Oey-Gardiner, and Ninasapti Triaswati. 2006. *Labor Markets in Asia*. Edited by Jesus Felipe and Rana Hasan. *Labor Markets in Asia: Issues and Perspectives*. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK. <https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230627383>.
- Suryahadi, Asep, Vita Febriany, and Athia Yumna. 2017. "Expanding Social Security in Indonesia: The Current Processes and Challenges." *Towards Universal Health Care in Emerging Economies*, 373–403. [https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-53377-7\\_14](https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-53377-7_14).
- Wahyuni, Sari, and Kwan Kee Ng. 2012. "Historical Outlook of Indonesian Competitiveness: Past and Current Performance." *Competitiveness Review* 22 (3): 207–34. <https://doi.org/10.1108/10595421211229646>.
- Walliman, Nicholas. 2006. *Social Research Methods. Social Research Methods*. 1 Oliver's Yard, 55 City Road, London England EC1Y 1SP United Kingdom: SAGE Publications, Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781849209939>.
- Watkins, Dawn, and Mandy Burton. 2017. *Research Methods in Law. Research Methods in Law*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315386669>.

Wihardja, Maria Monica, and Wendy Cunningham. 2021. *Pathways to Middle-Class Jobs in Indonesia. Pathways to Middle-Class Jobs in Indonesia.* World Bank. <https://doi.org/10.1596/35848>.

# The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights

## ORIGINALITY REPORT

18%

SIMILARITY INDEX

16%

INTERNET SOURCES

10%

PUBLICATIONS

5%

STUDENT PAPERS

## PRIMARY SOURCES

1	<a href="http://www.thefreelibrary.com">www.thefreelibrary.com</a> Internet Source	2%
2	<a href="http://go.gale.com">go.gale.com</a> Internet Source	2%
3	<a href="http://versita.com">versita.com</a> Internet Source	2%
4	<a href="http://www.jurnalhukumdanperadilan.org">www.jurnalhukumdanperadilan.org</a> Internet Source	2%
5	<a href="http://www.lexology.com">www.lexology.com</a> Internet Source	1%
6	Anak Agung Gede Duwira Hadi Santosa, Kadek Agus Sudiarawan, I Made Marta Wijaya. "The Employment Cluster of Omnibus Law: Embodiment the Concept of Nachtwakerstaat or Welfarestate?", Fiat Justisia: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum, 2021 Publication	1%
7	<a href="http://repo.uum.edu.my">repo.uum.edu.my</a> Internet Source	1%
8	<a href="http://repository.umi.ac.id">repository.umi.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%

9	<p>Indah Dwi Qurbani, Muhammad Rafid Zuhdi. "Analysis of the Energy and Mineral Source Regulation in the Formulation of Job Creation Law (Omnibus Law)", Administrative and Environmental Law Review, 2020</p> <p>Publication</p>	1 %
10	<p>Khairani, Sri Arnetti. "Protecting the rights of laid-off workers during the COVID-19 pandemic after the enactment of Law No. 11/2020 on Job Creation", Cogent Social Sciences, 2023</p> <p>Publication</p>	1 %
11	<p><a href="http://jurnal.bundamediagrup.co.id">jurnal.bundamediagrup.co.id</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p>	1 %
12	<p>Submitted to Konsorsium Perguruan Tinggi Swasta Indonesia</p> <p>Student Paper</p>	<1 %
13	<p>Seokwoo Lee, Hee Eun Lee. "Asian Yearbook of International Law, Volume 26 (2020)", Brill, 2023</p> <p>Publication</p>	<1 %
14	<p><a href="http://epdf.pub">epdf.pub</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p>	<1 %
15	<p>Muhamad Rosyid Jazuli, Maimanah Mohammed Idris, Penlope Yaguma. "The importance of institutional quality: Reviewing the relevance of Indonesia's Omnibus Law on national competitiveness",</p>	<1 %



# Humanities and Social Sciences Communications, 2022

Publication

- 
- |    |  |      |
|----|--|------|
| 16 | <a href="https://ojs.unimal.ac.id">ojs.unimal.ac.id</a><br>Internet Source   | <1 % |
| 17 | Harry Setya Nugraha, M. Yasin Al Arif, Mhd Zakiul Fikri. "Examining the Legal Standing of IKN Authority Regulations within Indonesian's Legislation System", <i>Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum dan Konstitusi</i> , 2023<br>Publication | <1 % |
| 18 | <a href="https://dinsights.katadata.co.id">dinsights.katadata.co.id</a><br>Internet Source   | <1 % |
| 19 | Submitted to Hult International Business School, Inc.<br>Student Paper   | <1 % |
| 20 | <a href="https://ijler.umsida.ac.id">ijler.umsida.ac.id</a><br>Internet Source   | <1 % |
| 21 | <a href="https://jurnal.unikal.ac.id">jurnal.unikal.ac.id</a><br>Internet Source   | <1 % |
| 22 | <a href="https://substantivejustice.id">substantivejustice.id</a><br>Internet Source   | <1 % |
| 23 | I Gusti Ayu Ketut Rachmi Handayani, Rais Torodji, Hartiwiningsih .. "The Criminal Justice System in Environmental Crime by Corporations", <i>KnE Social Sciences</i> , 2024<br>Publication   | <1 % |
-



24 Sela Nopela Milinum. "Problematika  
Fleksibilitas Outsourcing (Alih Daya) Pasca-  
Undang-Undang Nomor 11 Tahun 2020  
tentang Cipta Kerja Klaster  
Ketenagakerjaan", Jurnal Hukum Lex  
Generalis, 2022  
Publication

<1 %

25 [jurnal.ar-raniry.ac.id](http://jurnal.ar-raniry.ac.id)  
Internet Source

<1 %

26 [media.neliti.com](http://media.neliti.com)  
Internet Source

<1 %

27 [pdfs.semanticscholar.org](http://pdfs.semanticscholar.org)  
Internet Source

<1 %

28 [repository.essex.ac.uk](http://repository.essex.ac.uk)  
Internet Source

<1 %

29 [repository.ubaya.ac.id](http://repository.ubaya.ac.id)  
Internet Source

<1 %

30 Submitted to Coventry University  
Student Paper

<1 %

Exclude quotes Off

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography On

# The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights

---

PAGE 1

---



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Prep.** You may be using the wrong preposition.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.

PAGE 2

---



**Article Error** You may need to use an article before this word. Consider using the article **the**.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Article Error** You may need to remove this article.



**Confused** You have used either an imprecise word or an incorrect word.

PAGE 3

---



**Wrong Article** You may have used the wrong article or pronoun. Proofread the sentence to make sure that the article or pronoun agrees with the word it describes.



**Article Error** You may need to remove this article.

PAGE 4

---



**Missing ", "** Review the rules for using punctuation marks.



**Article Error** You may need to remove this article.



**Article Error** You may need to remove this article.



**P/V** You have used the passive voice in this sentence. You may want to revise it using the active voice.

PAGE 5

---



**Wrong Form** You may have used the wrong form of this word.



**P/V** You have used the passive voice in this sentence. You may want to revise it using the active voice.

PAGE 6

---



**Possessive**



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Missing ", "** Review the rules for using punctuation marks.



**Missing ", "** Review the rules for using punctuation marks.

PAGE 7

---



**Article Error** You may need to use an article before this word. Consider using the article **the**.



**Prep.** You may be using the wrong preposition.



**Wrong Article** You may have used the wrong article or pronoun. Proofread the sentence to make sure that the article or pronoun agrees with the word it describes.



**Wrong Article** You may have used the wrong article or pronoun. Proofread the sentence to make sure that the article or pronoun agrees with the word it describes.



**Prep.** You may be using the wrong preposition.

PAGE 8

---



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.



**Sp.** This word is misspelled. Use a dictionary or spellchecker when you proofread your work.

PAGE 9

---



**Article Error** You may need to remove this article.

PAGE 10

---

PAGE 11

---

PAGE 12

---

**Resubmission 1 and  
Review Response 1  
(April 13, 2024)**



---

## Submission | Manuscript ID CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

---

**Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice** <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com> April 13, 2024 at 12:32 PM

Reply To: editor@crlsj.com

To: Zainul Akhyar <zainulakhyar@ulm.ac.id>

Dear Editor,

As earlier advised in your last communication, I have submitted the revised manuscript ID: CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013 ("The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights") with the responses to the Reviewers comments addressed and tabulated as advised.

Please find the responses sheet attached to this mail.

Thank you

Regards

Zainul Akhyar  
Author

## AUTHOR'S RESPONSE TO REVIEWER COMMENTS

### Editor in Chief

Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice

**Manuscript ID:** CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

**Manuscript Title:** The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights

I am grateful for the detailed and constructive feedback provided by the reviewers. Following the recommendations, I have made the following revisions:

### Reviewer 1:

<p><b>Comment: Strengths</b></p> <p><b>Response:</b> We appreciate the reviewer's recognition of the relevance and timeliness of our work. We believe this topic is crucial given the significant legal and social implications of the Omnibus Law in Indonesia.</p>
<p><b>Comment: Areas of improvement</b></p>
<p><b>Responses:</b></p> <p>We acknowledge the suggestion to expand the comparative analysis. In response, we have added a section that compares Indonesia's Omnibus Law with similar legislative reforms in countries like India and Brazil. This addition aims to provide a broader international context.</p> <p>We agree that empirical data would strengthen the article. While our primary focus was on legal analysis, we have now included a brief discussion of available data from labor organizations that illustrate the law's impact on workers since its implementation.</p> <p>We have revised the article to simplify legal terminology where possible and added explanations for complex terms. We hope this makes the article more accessible to readers without a legal background.</p> <p>In response to the suggestion, we have expanded the conclusion to include specific policy recommendations. These recommendations focus on potential amendments to the Omnibus Law to better protect workers' rights while balancing economic considerations.</p>

I have submitted the revised manuscript with the above comments addressed as advised.

Sincerely,

Author

Zainul Akhyar (Corresponding Author)

**Second Review  
(May 02, 2024)**





---

## Revision | Manuscript ID: CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

1 message Zainul Akhyar <zainulakhyar@ulm.ac.id>

---

Journal Editor <editor@crlsj.com>

May 02, 2024 at 3:23 AM

To: zainulakhyar@ulm.ac.id

Dear Author,

Regarding your manuscript ID CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013 titled "**The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights**" you submitted to Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice.

We have now have the feedback regarding the second review. Based on the results of the second review, we still hold that **your manuscript** to proceed to publication after more revisions.

Once more, address the key points from the reviewers' comments as you revise your manuscript for the final time and submit the revised version within 30 days from the date of this letter.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Contemporary Readings in Law and Social

Justice.

Sincerely,

Regards  
Editorial Team  
Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice  
[www.crlsj.com](http://www.crlsj.com)

## REVIEW REPORT 2

**Manuscript ID:** CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

**Manuscript Title:** The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights

### Reviewer 2:

#### Strengths:

The author has effectively utilized a wide range of scholarly sources, including legal textbooks, journal articles, and government publications. This comprehensive use of literature demonstrates a strong foundation in the subject matter.

The article's emphasis on workers' rights, a critical aspect often overshadowed by economic arguments, is commendable. It highlights the potential human costs of the Omnibus Law and brings attention to the voices of the workers who are most affected.

#### Areas of Improvement:

While the article does an excellent job of focusing on constitutional issues, it could be improved by discussing the broader economic context in which the Omnibus Law was introduced. Analyzing the law's economic rationale would provide a more comprehensive understanding of the motivations behind the legislation.

The article primarily focuses on legal and workers' rights perspectives. Incorporating views from other stakeholders, such as employers, trade unions, and policymakers, would provide a more holistic view of the law's implications.

The methodology used for the legal analysis is not explicitly stated. Providing a brief explanation of the research approach, such as doctrinal analysis or critical legal studies, would clarify the theoretical framework and strengthen the scholarly rigor of the article.

The article could benefit from a more detailed exploration of potential constitutional challenges that could arise from the implementation of the Omnibus Law. Predicting how these challenges might unfold in the courts would add a forward-looking perspective to the analysis.

### Editor:

Consider reviewers' comments as providing a valuable roadmap for enhancing your manuscript. Please address the areas of improvement identified by the reviewers in your revised submission.

Best regards,

### Editorial Board

Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice

ISSN electrónico:

<https://www.crlsj.com/index.php/journal/>

**Second Review Response**  
**(May 28, 2024)**



---

## Second Re-Submission | Manuscript ID: CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

---

Zainul Akhyar <zainulakhyar@ulm.ac.id>

May 28, 2024 at 8:10 AM

To: Journal Editor <editor@crlsj.com>

Dear Editor,

This is in regard to the second resubmission of the revised manuscript ID: CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013 (“The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia’s Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers’ Rights”) with the responses to the Reviewers comments addressed.

Please find the responses sheet attached to this mail.

Thank you

Regards

Zainul Akhyar  
Author

## SECOND REVIEW RESPONSE

### Editor in Chief

Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice

**Manuscript ID:** CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

**Manuscript Title:** The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights

Below I present the second review response:

### Reviewer 1:

<p><b>Comment: Strengths</b></p> <p><b>Response:</b> We are pleased that the reviewer found our focus on constitutional rights to be a unique and valuable aspect of the article. Our intention was to highlight the potential constitutional conflicts arising from the Omnibus Law.</p>
<p><b>Comment: Areas of improvement</b></p> <p><b>Responses:</b></p> <p>We agree with the suggestion to discuss the broader economic context. We have added a section that explores the economic motivations behind the Omnibus Law, including the government's goals of attracting foreign investment and improving business efficiency.</p> <p>In response to the recommendation, we have incorporated perspectives from additional stakeholders, including employers and trade unions. This provides a more comprehensive view of the Omnibus Law's implications.</p> <p>We have added a section detailing our research methodology, clarifying that we employed a doctrinal legal analysis approach. This addition outlines the theoretical framework guiding our study.</p> <p>We have expanded our discussion on potential constitutional challenges that may arise from the Omnibus Law. We include hypothetical scenarios of how these challenges could be addressed in the courts, providing a forward-looking perspective.</p>

I have submitted the revised manuscript with the above comments addressed as advised.

Sincerely,

Author

Zainul Akhyar (Corresponding Author)

**Acceptance**  
**(June 18, 2024)**



---

## Editor's Decision - Manuscript ID CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013

---

Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com> June 18, 2024 at 3:19 PM

Reply-To: editor@crlsj.com

To: Zainul Akhyar <zainulakhyar@ulm.ac.id>

Dear Author,

Paper Id: CRLSJ\_2024\_07\_1013 Paper Title: **The Constitutional Implications of Indonesia's Omnibus Job Creation Law on Workers' Rights**. We would like to inform you that your paper is accepted for publication in Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice **that will be available online at** <https://www.crlsj.com/index.php/journal/>.

After completion of the registration processes your research paper will be available on the upcoming issue of Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice.

Kindly follow the given steps for complete registration: 1. Download copyright form and manuscript template from the link below: Manuscript Template: [https://crlsj.com/downloads/paper\\_template.docx](https://crlsj.com/downloads/paper_template.docx) Copyright form: [https://crlsj.com/downloads/copyright\\_form.pdf](https://crlsj.com/downloads/copyright_form.pdf)

Thank you for choosing us.

Editor  
Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice  
[www.crlsj.com](http://www.crlsj.com)

Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice

ISSN: 1948-9137, e-ISSN: 2162-2752

Vol 16 (1), 2024

pp. 97-104



16/08/2024

Dear Author,

*Zainul Akhyar, Mariatul Kiptiah, Muhammad Elmy*

*Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, South Kalimantan Province, 70123 Indonesia*

This is to inform you that your manuscript, titled "Evolving Perspective on Audit Quality: Market Concentration, Branch Offices, Span of Control, and Tenure," has been accepted for publication in the Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice.

Download copyright form and manuscript template from the link below: Manuscript Template: [https://crlsj.com/downloads/paper\\_template.docx](https://crlsj.com/downloads/paper_template.docx)

Copyright form: [https://crlsj.com/downloads/copyright\\_form.pdf](https://crlsj.com/downloads/copyright_form.pdf)

We encourage you to review the final proofs thoroughly once they are sent to you, to ensure that all details are correct and to make any last-minute adjustments if necessary.

Best regards,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to be 'A. Akhyar', with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Editor

Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice

[www.crlsj.com](http://www.crlsj.com)