



Zainuddin <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Sat, Feb 11, 2023 at 12:09 PM

To: "Zainuddin" <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Zainuddin,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Environmental Law Enforcement in Illegal Mining Cases in Indonesia

Author(s): Zainuddin

Corresponding Author: Zainuddin

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 11-February-2023(UTC)

In a couple of days, a confirmation email including the manuscript ID will be again forwarded to you when the journal manager looks through your submission and confirms it. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



Zainuddin <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Zainuddin" <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

Sat, Feb 11, 2023 at 2:41 PM

Dear Dr. Zainuddin,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Environmental Law Enforcement in Illegal Mining Cases in Indonesia

Author(s): Zainuddin

Corresponding Author: Zainuddin

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 11-February-2023(UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-675-2023

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.



Zainuddin <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Zainuddin" <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

Mon, Mar 27, 2023 at 11:38 AM

Dear Dr. Zainuddin,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Environmental Law Enforcement in Illegal Mining Cases in Indonesia".

Our decision is: **Revisions Required**

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.

Reviewer- A

Decision: Major revisions required

The paper Environmental Law Enforcement in Illegal Mining Cases in Indonesia presents a comprehensive overview of the issue of illicit mining in Indonesia, its impact on the environment and society, and the need for effective enforcement of environmental laws. Here 's a critical review of various aspects of the paper:

1. The introduction effectively outlines the purpose of the research, which is to examine the enforcement of environmental law in cases of illegal mining in Indonesia. It provides a clear context for the reader. It should also set the scope of the study by briefly explaining the significance of mining permits, the link between mining law and environmental law, and the problems associated with mismanagement and corruption.
2. The literature review part does well in highlighting the detrimental environmental impacts of illicit mining, such as water contamination, deforestation, and biodiversity decline. This creates a compelling case for the need for strong environmental law enforcement. It should also give an overview of Indonesia 's legislative framework related to environmental protection, which provides context for the subsequent discussion on enforcement.
3. The authors must acknowledge the complexity of issues related to illegal mining, such as social unrest, criminal behavior, and economic inequalities. This will add depth to the discussion and show an understanding of the multifaceted nature of the problem.
4. The mention of corruption in the mining sector is critical, as it highlights a significant challenge. However, it would be beneficial to provide some examples or case studies to illustrate the extent of corruption.

5. The discussion of mismanagement during the decentralization era is insightful, but it could be further enriched with data or concrete examples to strengthen the argument.

Reviewer –B**Decision: Major revisions required**

The current study effectively lays out the background and context for the study of illegal mining in Indonesia and the importance of enforcing environmental laws. To further improve the paper, you could consider improving the following areas.

1. The literature review and methodology section provides a detailed and comprehensive overview of the environmental law in Indonesia and its enforcement in the context of illegal mining. However, the literature review must effectively identify the research gap related to the impact of public environmental regulation on private lenders' monitoring efforts and their effectiveness in mitigating corporate pollution.
2. The review cites recent studies (Choy et al., 202; hao et al., 2022; Shi et al., 2021) to support the research background, indicating that the study is up-to-date with the latest research in the field.
3. The methodology section is clear and well-structured. It explains the research philosophy, approach, data sources, and methods employed in the study. The rationale for choosing a qualitative research methodology is provided, emphasizing its ability to provide a comprehensive understanding of the issue. However, it might be useful to briefly mention the limitations of this approach.
4. The authors should discuss specific legislation related to environmental protection and mining, such as the Mineral and Coal Mining Law, Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Regulation, Forestry Law, Marine and Fisheries Law, and others. This detail is beneficial for readers seeking specific information.
5. The limitations section should mention challenges related to data collection, the evolving nature of illegal mining, and the complexity of social and political factors. This is essential for acknowledging the constraints of the study.

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>



Zainuddin <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Zainuddin" <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

Tue, Apr 25, 2023 at 2:08 PM

Dear Dr. Zainuddin,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Environmental Law Enforcement in Illegal Mining Cases in Indonesia

Author(s): Zainuddin

Corresponding Author: Zainuddin

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 11-February-2023(UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-675-2023

We have confirmed and forwarded your revision submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.

Response to Reviewer 1

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	<p>The paper Environmental Law Enforcement in Illegal Mining Cases in Indonesia presents a comprehensive overview of the issue of illicit mining in Indonesia, its impact on the environment and society, and the need for effective enforcement of environmental laws. Here's a critical review of various aspects of the paper:</p>	<p>Many thanks respected reviewer for your kind remarks and suggestions.</p>
1	<p>The introduction effectively outlines the purpose of the research, which is to examine the enforcement of environmental law in cases of illegal mining in Indonesia. It provides a clear context for the reader. It should also set the scope of the study by briefly explaining the significance of mining permits, the link between mining law and environmental law, and the problems associated with mismanagement and corruption.</p>	<p>Many thanks for your kind suggestions. Done as per suggestion. Please see pages 2-6</p>
2	<p>The literature review part does well in highlighting the detrimental environmental impacts of illicit mining, such as water contamination, deforestation, and biodiversity decline. This creates a compelling case for the need for strong environmental law enforcement. It should also give an overview of Indonesia's legislative framework related to</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines. We have now provided an overview of Indonesia's legislative framework related to environmental protection, which provides context for the subsequent discussion on enforcement. Please see pages 8-13</p>

	environmental protection, which provides context for the subsequent discussion on enforcement.	
3	The authors must acknowledge the complexity of issues related to illegal mining, such as social unrest, criminal behavior, and economic inequalities. This will add depth to the discussion and show an understanding of the multifaceted nature of the problem.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. We have now acknowledged the complexity of issues related to illegal mining, such as social unrest, criminal behavior, and economic inequalities Please see page 12
4	The mention of corruption in the mining sector is critical, as it highlights a significant challenge. However, it would be beneficial to provide some examples or case studies to illustrate the extent of corruption.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done. Please see page 14 and 19
5	The discussion of mismanagement during the decentralization era is insightful, but it could be further enriched with data or concrete examples to strengthen the argument.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done. Please see page 16

Response to Reviewer 2

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	<p>The current study effectively lays out the background and context for the study of illegal mining in Indonesia and the importance of enforcing environmental laws. To further improve the paper, you could consider improving the following areas.</p>	<p>Thank you, dear reviewer.</p>
1	<p>The literature review and methodology section provides a detailed and comprehensive overview of the environmental law in Indonesia and its enforcement in the context of illegal mining. However, the literature review must effectively identify the research gap related to the impact of public environmental regulation on private lenders' monitoring efforts and their effectiveness in mitigating corporate pollution.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see pages 11-14</p>
2	<p>The review cites recent studies (Choy et al., 2023; Zhao et al., 2022; Shi et al., 2021) to support the research background, indicating that the study is up-to-date with the latest research in the field.</p>	<p>Many thanks.</p>
3	<p>The methodology section is clear and well-structured. It explains the research philosophy, approach, data sources, and methods employed in the study. The rationale for choosing a qualitative research</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, we have now briefly mentioned the limitations of this approach. Please see page 14</p>

	<p>methodology is provided, emphasizing its ability to provide a comprehensive understanding of the issue. However, it might be useful to briefly mention the limitations of this approach.</p>	
4	<p>The authors should discuss specific legislation related to environmental protection and mining, such as the Mineral and Coal Mining Law, Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Regulation, Forestry Law, Marine and Fisheries Law, and others. This detail is beneficial for readers seeking specific information.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, Thank you.</p> <p>We have now discussed specific legislation related to environmental protection and mining, such as the Mineral and Coal Mining Law, Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Regulation, Forestry Law, Marine and Fisheries Law, and others.</p> <p>Please see pages 12, 16-18</p>
5	<p>The limitations section should mention challenges related to data collection, the evolving nature of illegal mining, and the complexity of social and political factors. This is essential for acknowledging the constraints of the study.</p>	<p>Done, dear reviewer as suggested.</p> <p>Please see pages 22-23</p>



Zainuddin <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Zainuddin" <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

Sat, Jun 17, 2023 at 9:53 AM

Dear Dr. Zainuddin,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Environmental Law Enforcement in Illegal Mining Cases in Indonesia".

Our decision is: **Revisions Required**

Please revise your manuscript based on the reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month.
Let me know if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.



Zainuddin <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Zainuddin" <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

Fri, Jul 07, 2023 at 12:40 PM

Dear Dr. Zainuddin,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Environmental Law Enforcement in Illegal Mining Cases in Indonesia

Author(s): Zainuddin

Corresponding Author: Zainuddin

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 11-February-2023(UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-675-2023

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission revision for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.

Response to Reviewers

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	This is a good version of the paper.	Many thanks, Respected Reviewer.
1	However, one minor improvement could be to ensure consistency in numbering the sections of your implications. Overall, it's a well-structured and informative conclusion section.	Dear reviewer many thanks, Done.
2	The limitation section should also touch on the enforcement mechanisms, such as penalties and oversight agencies, which are crucial in understanding how the laws are enforced.	Dear reviewer. The limitation section is now aligned on the enforcement mechanisms, such as penalties and oversight agencies, which are crucial in understanding how the laws are enforced. Please see page 21
3	The authors must successfully link each piece of legislation to its relevance in addressing illegal mining activities, which aligns with the study's objective.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. We have linked each piece of legislation to its relevance in addressing illegal mining activities, which aligns with the study's objective . Please see pages 5, 20-21



Zainuddin <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Zainuddin" <zainuddin@ulm.ac.id>

Fri, Aug 18, 2023 at 11:46 AM

Dear Dr. Zainuddin,

Congratulations! the following of your manuscript.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Environmental Law Enforcement in Illegal Mining Cases in Indonesia

Author(s): Zainuddin

Corresponding Author: Zainuddin

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 11-February-2023(UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-675-2023

Has been accepted for publication in *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences* (Vol. 18 No. 2, 2023). Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on.

We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.