



Mulyani Zulaeha <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Mulyani Zulaeha" <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

Sat, Aug 06, 2022, at 1:49 PM

Dear Dr. Mulyani Zulaeha,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: E-Courts in Indonesia: Exploring the Opportunities and Challenges for Justice and Advancement to Judicial Efficiency

Author(s): Mulyani Zulaeha

Corresponding Author: Mulyani Zulaeha

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-August -2022 (UTC)

In a couple of days, a confirmation email including the manuscript ID will be again forwarded to you when the journal manager looks through your submission and confirms it. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.



Mulyani Zulaeha <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Mulyani Zulaeha" <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

Sat, Aug 06, 2022, at 2:42 PM

Dear Dr. Mulyani Zulaeha,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: E-Courts in Indonesia: Exploring the Opportunities and Challenges for Justice and Advancement to Judicial Efficiency

Author(s): Mulyani Zulaeha

Corresponding Author: Mulyani Zulaeha

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-August -2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-617-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.



Mulyani Zulaeha <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Mulyani Zulaeha" <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

Thu, Sep 15, 2022, at 10:54 AM

Dear Dr. Mulyani Zulaeha,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "E-Courts in Indonesia: Exploring the Opportunities and Challenges for Justice and Advancement to Judicial Efficiency".

Our decision is: **Revisions Required**

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service .
Please do not reply to this mail.

Reviewer- A

Decision: Major revisions required

The study E-Courts in Indonesia : Exploring the Opportunities and Challenges for Justice and Advancement to Judicial Efficiency focused on the implementation of electronic trials in Indonesian civil procedures law (ICPL). It highlights the lengthy and complex nature of civil trials based on HIR/RBG and the response of the Indonesian Supreme Court in issuing "PERMA Number 1 of 2019" to address these issues. The abstract discusses the benefits, opportunities, and challenges associated with e-trials, emphasizing their effectiveness in providing timely justice and improving the efficiency of the judiciary. However, it lacks critical analysis of certain aspects and would benefit from additional information on the research methodology.

1. The abstract effectively sets the context by highlighting the existing problems in civil trials in Indonesia and the Supreme Court's response through the issuance of "PERMA Number 1 of 2019". It should also highlight the benefits of e-trials, such as reducing the need for physical presence in court, simplifying case registration, and enabling electronic payment and summoning of parties. These points will provide a clear understanding of the advantages that electronic trials can bring to the Indonesian judicial system.
2. The paper lacks a critical analysis of the challenges associated with implementing electronic trials. It briefly mentions the obstacles and limitations but does not delve into them in detail. It would have been beneficial to explore potential concerns, such as technological infrastructure, cybersecurity, potential biases in virtual proceedings, and ensuring equal access to justice for all parties. Addressing these challenges would have provided a more balanced perspective on the feasibility and implications of e-trials in ICPL.
3. The paper mentions that the study utilized a qualitative normative judicial approach, but it does not provide any information on the specific research methodology employed. Including an explanation of the research design, data collection methods, and sources

of data would have enhanced the abstract 's credibility and helped readers understand the basis for the study's findings.

4. The paper does emphasize the theoretical and practical implications of the research but lacks specific examples or details. It would be helpful to provide concrete examples of the theoretical contributions and practical applications of the study's findings, as well as how they can inform future research or policy development in the context of electronic trials.
5. The paper should briefly conclude the research findings for more clarity.

Reviewer -B**Decision: Major revisions required**

This research paper is linked to the implementation of electronic trials in Indonesian Civil Procedural Law (ICPL). Here's a critical review of the text:

1. The study briefly describes the research methodology used for the study, which is a qualitative research strategy with an interpretivism research philosophy. The information provides a general overview of the research approach. It lacks specific details about the data collection methods, sample selection, and data analysis techniques. More information about these aspects would enhance the transparency and reliability of the research.
2. The literature review section provides an overview of the existing literature on civil dispute resolution, conventional trial procedures, and the implementation of electronic trials in different countries. The references to various cases and their outcomes help support the argument for the effectiveness and benefits of electronic trials. However, a balanced discussion of the topic would provide a more comprehensive understanding.
3. The results and discussion section is divided into subsections that focus on different aspects of electronic trials in Indonesian Civil Procedural law. It provides an overview of the implementation of electronic trials in Indonesia, including the introduction of the E-Court application and the benefits it offers. However, the section lacks specific findings from the research study being reviewed. It would be more informative to include empirical findings or insights derived from the qualitative analysis of the data. Without specific research findings, the discussion remains primarily descriptive and does not contribute significantly to the understanding of the topic.
4. The text generally follows a logical structure with clear headings for each section. However, there are some instances where the transition between paragraphs and subsections could be improved for better coherence and flow. Additionally, the use of subheadings within each subsection could enhance the organization and readability of the text, making it easier for readers to follow the main points and arguments.
5. The text includes citations and references to support the claims made throughout the review. However, there are inconsistencies in the formatting and style of the citations, which should be addressed for clarity and consistency. Additionally, providing in-text citations for specific statements or claims would improve the traceability of the information presented.

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcs.com>



Mulyani Zulaeha <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Mulyani Zulaeha" <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

Mon, Oct 24, 2022, at 9:39 AM

Dear Dr. Mulyani Zulaeha,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: E-Courts in Indonesia: Exploring the Opportunities and Challenges for Justice and Advancement to Judicial Efficiency

Author(s): Mulyani Zulaeha

Corresponding Author: Mulyani Zulaeha

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-August -2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-617-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your revision submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.

Response to Reviewer 1

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	<p>The study E-Courts in Indonesia: Exploring the Opportunities and Challenges for Justice and Advancement to Judicial Efficiency focused on the implementation of electronic trials in Indonesian civil procedures law (ICPL). It highlights the lengthy and complex nature of civil trials based on HIR/RBG and the response of the Indonesian Supreme Court in issuing "PERMA Number 1 of 2019" to address these issues. The abstract discusses the benefits, opportunities, and challenges associated with e-trials, emphasizing their effectiveness in providing timely justice and improving the efficiency of the judiciary. However, it lacks critical analysis of certain aspects and would benefit from additional information on the research methodology.</p>	<p>Thanks, dear reviewer.</p>
1	<p>The abstract effectively sets the context by highlighting the existing problems in civil trials in Indonesia and the Supreme Court's response through the issuance of "PERMA Number 1 of 2019." It should also highlight the benefits of e-trials, such as reducing the need for physical presence in court, simplifying case registration, and enabling electronic payment and summoning of parties. These points will provide a clear understanding of the advantages that</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. In abstract, we highlighted the benefits of e-trials, such as reducing the need for physical presence in court, simplifying case registration, and enabling electronic payment and summoning parties.</p> <p>Please see page1</p>

	electronic trials can bring to the Indonesian judicial system.	
2	The paper lacks a critical analysis of the challenges associated with implementing electronic trials. It briefly mentions the obstacles and limitations but does not delve into them in detail. It would have been beneficial to explore potential concerns, such as technological infrastructure, cybersecurity, potential biases in virtual proceedings, and ensuring equal access to justice for all parties. Addressing these challenges would have provided a more balanced perspective on the feasibility and implications of e-trials in ICPL.	Respected reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested by your kind self throughout the paper. Please see page 6-13
3	The paper mentions that the study utilized a qualitative normative judicial approach, but it does not provide any information on the specific research methodology employed. Including an explanation of the research design, data collection methods, and sources of data would have enhanced the abstract's credibility and helped readers understand the basis for the study's findings.	Respected reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. We have now added an explanation of the research design, data collection methods, and sources of data. Please see page 13
4	The paper does emphasize the theoretical and practical implications of the research but lacks specific examples or details. It would be helpful to provide concrete examples of the theoretical contributions and practical applications of the study's	Respected reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. We have now provided concrete examples of the theoretical contributions and practical applications of the study's findings, as well as how they can

	findings, as well as how they can inform future research or policy development in the context of electronic trials.	inform future research or policy development in the context of electronic trials. Please see pages 18-20
5	The paper should briefly conclude the research findings for more clarity.	Thank you, dear reviewer. Done as suggested by your kind self throughout the paper.

Response to Reviewer 2

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	This research paper is linked to the implementation of electronic trials in Indonesian Civil Procedural Law (ICPL). Here's a critical review of the text:	Thankyou respected reviewer.
1	The study briefly describes the research methodology used for the study, which is a qualitative research strategy with an interpretivism research philosophy. The information provides a general overview of the research approach. It lacks specific details about the data collection methods, sample selection, and data analysis techniques. More information about these aspects would enhance the transparency and reliability of the research.	Thankyou, dear review. Done as suggested by your kind self. Please see pages 2-6
2	The literature review section provides an overview of the existing literature on civil dispute resolution, conventional trial procedures, and the implementation of electronic trials in different countries. The references to various cases and their	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested by your kind self. Please see pages 6-13

	<p>outcomes help support the argument for the effectiveness and benefits of electronic trials. However, a balanced discussion of the topic would provide a more comprehensive understanding.</p>	
3	<p>The results and discussion section is divided into subsections that focus on different aspects of electronic trials in Indonesian Civil Procedural Law. It provides an overview of the implementation of electronic trials in Indonesia, including the introduction of the E-Court application and the benefits it offers. However, the section lacks specific findings from the research study being reviewed. It would be more informative to include empirical findings or insights derived from the qualitative analysis of the data. Without specific research findings, the discussion remains primarily descriptive and does not contribute significantly to the understanding of the topic.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer. Thank you for your kind suggestions. We have now added specific empirical findings and insights derived from the qualitative analysis of the data.</p> <p>Please see pages 1-17</p>
4	<p>The text generally follows a logical structure with clear headings for each section. However, there are some instances where the transition between paragraphs and subsections could be improved for better coherence and flow. Additionally, the use of subheadings within each subsection could enhance the organization and readability of the text, making it easier for</p>	<p>Dear reviewer. Done as per suggestion throughout the manuscript.</p>

	readers to follow the main points and arguments.	
5	The text includes citations and references to support the claims made throughout the review. However, there are inconsistencies in the formatting and style of the citations, which should be addressed for clarity and consistency. Additionally, providing in-text citations for specific statements or claims would improve the traceability of the information presented.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested throughout the manuscript.



Mulyani Zulaeha <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Mulyani Zulaeha" <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

Fri, Dec 02, 2022, at 10:47 AM

Dear Dr. Mulyani Zulaeha,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "E-Courts in Indonesia: Exploring the Opportunities and Challenges for Justice and Advancement to Judicial Efficiency".

Our decision is: **Revisions Required**

Please revise your manuscript based on the reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service .
Please do not reply to this mail.



Mulyani Zulaeha <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Mulyani Zulaeha" <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

Mon, Jan 09, 2023, at 11:29 AM

Dear Dr. Mulyani Zulaeha,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: E-Courts in Indonesia: Exploring the Opportunities and Challenges for Justice and Advancement to Judicial Efficiency

Author(s): Mulyani Zulaeha

Corresponding Author: Mulyani Zulaeha

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-August -2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-617-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission revision for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.

Response to Reviewers

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	Here are some more required changes that authors should make.	Thank you, respected reviewer.
1	There must be a conclusion section presenting an overview of the implementation of electronic trials in Indonesia, highlighting both the advantages and challenges associated with this transformation.	Thank you, dear review. Done as suggested by your kind self. Please see pages 21-22
2	The paper lacks a clear structure and logical flow. It would benefit from breaking down the content into separate paragraphs or sections to enhance readability and comprehension.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as suggested by your kind self.
3	The recommendations section could be made more concise and specific. It would be helpful to provide actionable suggestions for overcoming the challenges identified and ensuring the effective implementation of electronic trials in Indonesia.	Dear reviewer. Thank you for your kind suggestions. Done as per suggestion. Please see pages 18-19



Mulyani Zulaeha <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Mulyani Zulaeha" <mulyani.zulaeha@ulm.ac.id>

Wed, Feb 15, 2023, at 2:31 PM

Dear Dr. Mulyani Zulaeha,

Congratulations! the following of your manuscript.

Track: Regular Track

Title: E-Courts in Indonesia: Exploring the Opportunities and Challenges for Justice and Advancement to Judicial Efficiency

Author(s): Mulyani Zulaeha

Corresponding Author: Mulyani Zulaeha

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 06-August -2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-617-2022

Has been accepted for publication in *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences* (Vol. 18 No. 1, 2023). Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on.

We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service .

Please do not reply to this mail.