



Femiana Gapsari, ST., MT <memi_kencrut@ub.ac.id>

Manuscript Needs Major Revision (#IJE-2009-3325 (R1))

2 messages

International Journal of Engineering <journal@iranjournals.ir>
Reply-To: International Journal of Engineering <ije.editor8@gmail.com>
To: memi_kencrut@ub.ac.id, femianagapsari@gmail.com

Tue, Nov 10, 2020 at 1:49 AM

Manuscript ID: IJE-2009-3325

Manuscript Title: **Hydroxyapatite (Ha) Coating on Stainless Steel 316L using Flame Spray Technique**

Authors: Femiana Gapsari

Dear Respectful Author **Prof. Femiana Gapsari**

Your manuscript required major revisions. In this case we normally treat it as unacceptable for publication. However, as numerous editorial errors have pointed out by the reviewers, the **International Journal of Engineering** editor believes that the manuscript could be rectified and prepare for possible publication. We required itemized answer and rebuttal letter to respond all specified reviewers. A marked or highlighted manuscript is required to observe any changes and revision made by the respectful author.

Please let us know your views and respond in this regard and in the case of positive response, reply us within 7 days time.

Truly yours,

Editorial Office of **International Journal of Engineering**

It is recommended to cite and be benefited from IJE's published articles in your specific field; IJE original research papers are available online since 1988: www.IJE.ir

Reviewers Recommendation:

Reviewer 1:

File Sent by Reviewer:

http://www.ije.ir/jufile?__file=Dj.x.bmgZVo7U2RSUAsotuJsuJL2mK9iSoqSZuHo9bnNY6ABcxZh8GSsyvFV05pS0_d7uTbyjOzB35wqFnxOKrRjIDCc_hdZ6iMeonrzTn8AV0mTV.DF4htfVDGCJJrdoG_8sfnzS55TbRVz.Pu8_AaLb7xgDE6qBc8E.G_uf2mr4bKM90JHGphpr4PRykq

Reviewer Comment For Author:

Comments for Authors:

Abstract:

- 1- The abstract needs more clarity and arrangement.
- 2- The comma should replacement with dots for example 123,5 change to 123.5
- 3- Is the corrosion rate measured per year?

Introduction:

- 1- The aim of the study needs more details to compare this work with the previous study.
- 2- Needs to re-arrangement.

Materials and methods:

- 1- The chemical composition of the material should mention in table not in text.
- 2- The units in figure 1 should put them beside the numbers.
- 3- Oxygen flow-rate and pressure were selected according to reference or roughly, if they selected depends on reference they should state it.
- 4- There are some paragraphs need re-arrangement.
- 5- In coating thickness section, there is error 60m, check the unit.
- 6- In Tafel test, why they do not try with the acidic and basic solution to measure the corrosion rate.
- 7- There are some figures need high clarity for curves and axes.
- 8- In morphology section, there is extra paragraph, they should delete, and this is instructions for journal.

Results and Discussion:

- 1- There are important results are missed in the paper and these results are important (for example bending strength and scratch between the substrate and coating layers).
- 2- Section 3-1 needs re-arrangement.
- 3- Do not repeat the information for example the values of Ra are mentioned in table, figure, and paragraph.
- 4- In section 3-3 they should start with paragraph not figures.
- 5- Figures of Tafel test should match with the standard (E on Y-axis and I on the X-axis) and there is error to name the y-axis is I_{corr}. I_{corr} and E_{corr} determine by the contact line for the anodic and cathodic curve and the joining point for them represent the I_{corr} and E_{corr}.
- 6- In materials and methods do not show how corrosion rate measured, they should mention all details and equations for measuring the corrosion rate.
- 7- Do not mention the coating layer for SEM.

References:

They should state the DOI for them.

Manuscript Evaluation Form:

http://www.ije.ir/author?__au=ECsGnyDf_qBQ8UuciWjSvTGHywc5l34jzZgtpwNk6HFscI_hkuLtX5uzuiVMDL39

Reviewer 2:

Reviewer Comment For Author:

The topic of the article under the title: "Hydroxyapatite (Ha) Coating on Stainless Steel 316L using Flame Spray Technique" is in line with the topic of the International Journal of Engineering. The paper is original scientific work.

The article before publication required the corrections:

- Keywords: please add "coating"
- Introduction – please give the information about novelty of the research
- "The Coating Thickness Measurement " – please verify the range of thickness measured by device.
- Lack of discussion part and comparison with up-date literature.
- The literature need to be up-dated. Only two references from the articles from 2019. Lack of articles from 2020.
- The whole text, including references, needs editing job.

Manuscript Evaluation Form:

http://www.ije.ir/author?__au=BHzH3d1YV_OKJvPjOPxLXaCKOXW0buhLqqOvmWhhYks0gZeE7yWaAaauphfKToT

Femiana Gapsari, ST., MT <memi_kencrut@ub.ac.id>
To: International Journal of Engineering <ije.editor8@gmail.com>

Tue, Nov 10, 2020 at 9:33 AM

Dear Editor of IJE Transaction A,

Thank you for giving me a chance to revise my manuscript. How long will you give me to revise my manuscript?

Best,

Femiana Gapsari

[Quoted text hidden]