

# Jurnal 4

*by* Dedy Ari Nugroho

---

**Submission date:** 29-Mar-2023 08:27AM (UTC+0700)

**Submission ID:** 1865947561

**File name:** 4.JURNAL\_-\_Creativity\_Of\_Pancasila.docx (55.23K)

**Word count:** 4043

**Character count:** 22307

## Creativity Of Pancasila Education Teachers and Citizens in Making Learning Media

<sup>4</sup> **Rabiatul Adawiah**<sup>1)</sup>, **Dian Agus Rochlydi**<sup>2)</sup>, **Taufik Hidayat**<sup>3)</sup>

<sup>1, 2, 3)</sup> Program Studi Pendidikan Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan Fakultas Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Jl. Brigjen H. Hasan Basry Banjarmasin, Indonesia  
Corresponding Author: Rabiatul Adawiah, Email: [rabiatuladawiah@ulm.ac.id](mailto:rabiatuladawiah@ulm.ac.id)

**History:** Received 07/09/2022 | Revised 08/10/2022 | Accepted 03/11/2022 | Published 30/11/2022

**Abstract.** Based on observations of Pancasila and Citizenship Education teachers in secondary schools, almost all of the learning media used rely on those already available in schools. However, in contrast to the Pancasila and Citizenship Education teachers in general, the Pancasila and Citizenship Education teachers at SMP Negeri 2 Kusan Hilir are very creative teachers to make various learning media, so that many achievements have been achieved both at the regional and provincial levels. This study aims to determine the creativity of teachers Pancasila and civic education in making learning media and knowing students' interest in participating in learning Pancasila and civic education. This research is a qualitative research with descriptive method. Data was collected by using interview, observation and documentation techniques. The data obtained were analyzed qualitatively with the stages of data collection (data collection), data reduction (data reduction), data presentation (data display), and drawing conclusions or verification (conclusions). From this study it can be concluded that teachers Pancasila and civic education at the State Junior High School 2 Kusan Hilir, Tanah Bumbu Regency is very creative in making learning media. Some of the learning media that have been created include: Child Moral Control Tree (Pokemon), traditional Banjar Batewah game media, constitution-themed song media, ethnic diversity media through used newspapers, and picture guessing media. Implementation of learning Pancasila and civic education with a variety of media makes students more interested and motivated to take part in learning.

**Keywords:** Creativity; Education; Teacher; Making; Learning Media

### INTRODUCTION

Education is very important for every human being, because with education, humans can improve the quality of their lives or their dignity and status in the community. In an effort to produce quality education, many factors are influential, and one of them is the teacher. Teachers are at the forefront of creating quality human resources. Through the learning process in the classroom, the teacher deals directly with students. In the hands of the teacher will produce quality students both academically, skills, emotional maturity as well as morally and spiritually (Kunandar, 2011).

<sup>3</sup>  
In the Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System Chapter I Article 1 states that education is a conscious and planned effort to create a learning atmosphere and learning process so that students actively develop their potential to have religious spiritual strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble character, as well as the skills needed by himself, society, nation and state. That is, education in schools is a planned and purposeful process, so that everything that teachers and students do can achieve learning objectives.

Seeing the goals of national education, the effectiveness of learning must be improved, because the learning process plays an important role in producing or creating quality graduates. In the educational process, it is necessary to have a learning strategy, use of appropriate methods, media and learning models so that it can create a comfortable learning atmosphere and can generate enthusiasm for learning in students in all subject areas, including learning Pancasila and Citizenship Education (Anggraeni, 2019).

Pancasila and Citizenship Education (PPKn) is a subject that focuses on the formation of students' self, be it religion, socio-culture, language, age, and ethnicity to become Indonesian citizens who are intelligent, skilled, and characterized by Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution. and adopting all living habits naturally (Widiyatmaka, 2016; Sumardjoko & Musyiam, 2018).

Civics learning in schools aims to master the competency standards that have been set. Therefore, learning must be made more interesting and easy to understand, because Civics requires more understanding than memorization. Civics lessons need special attention so that these subjects can be of interest to students and even considered important as a way to educate the nation's life in accordance with the constitutional mandate (Hidayat, 2020).

The fact shows that among students there has been a strong impression that Civics lessons are difficult to understand and always less interesting. Not a few students feel bored when they are going to take part in PPKn lessons (Kartono, 2017). Many students view Civics as a very boring subject. Teachers in delivering subject matter often use the lecture method and expect students to sit, be quiet, listen, take notes and memorize only (Taukhid, 2016). Based on research results Sanistiyasari (Irdianti, Mahadewi, L. & Widiana, 2020) that mCitizenship education is one of the subjects that students are less interested in, because understanding the material is not an easy thing for students to do. In fact, interest in learning is one of the factors that can affect learning outcomes (Supriyono, 2018). Interest in learning has a significant effect on learning outcomes, the better student interest in learning will have an impact on student learning outcomes that are getting better (Nurhasanah, 2016).

To cultivate students' interest in following learning, teachers must be more creative, and one of them is in making learning media. Learning media is one component that has an important role in supporting the learning process and facilitating the delivery of material or concepts to students (Sanistiyasari, Putra, & Suniasih, 2019). The use of media in the learning process can provide meaningful experiences for students (Supriyono, 2018). The importance of using media in learning is

also stated by (Wahyuningtyas & Sulasmono, 2020) that using learning media will increase students' ability to understand subject matter easily. PThe use of media in the learning process can have implications for three things, including on the teacher, on the students and on the learning process in the classroom (Suda, 2016).

However, based on observations of several teachers, especially Pancasila and Citizenship Education teachers, it is rare to find creative ones to make learning media, other than relying on media already available in schools. However, unlike the general PPKn teachers, the Civics teachers at SMP Negeri 2 Kusan Hilir are creative teachers to create various learning media, so that many achievements have been achieved both at the regional and provincial levels.

Research on learning media has often been done. Among them was carried out by (Gawise, Jamin & Azizah 2022) who researched the role of learning media in strengthening civics learning in elementary schools, H.the results of his research indicate that the role of learning media in strengthening learning civic education can clarify the presentation of messages so that they are not too verbal. Another study was carried out by (Hartini, 2022) who examined the influence of learning media on student achievement. The results of the study concluded that learning media had an effect on student achievement at MIS Hidayatullah Aluh-Aluh Banjar

Regency. The results of a similar study were also stated by (Wahyuningtyas, & Sulasmono 2020) who in their research conclusion stated that pthe use of learning media is very influential on student learning outcomes

Research on learning media was also carried out by (Prianggita & Meliawati, 2021) who examined the Role of Information and Communication Technology-Based Learning Media in the Era of the Covid-19 Pandemic. The results of his research conclude that the role of information and communication technology-based learning media can provide opportunities for broad, effective and efficient coverage of new knowledge through various packaging and dissemination of information as well as providing a broad role for educators to design student learning by emphasizing efforts to prepare learning materials that are challenging, full of stimulus, systematic and continuous.

Even though they both researched learning media, some previous studies examined the role of learning media, while this study focused on the creativity of teachers in making learning media.

## RESEARCH METHODS

This research was conducted at SMP Negeri 2 Kusan Hilir, Pagatan Tanah Bumbu sub-district, South Kalimantan. SMP Negeri 2 Kusan Hilir was chosen as the research location because the Civics teachers at this

school have won various awards at both the provincial and national levels.

Informants in this study were principals, teachers and students. Data was collected through interviews, observation and documentation. In order to obtain valid and justifiable research findings, the validity of the data is tested by extending observations, increasing persistence, and triangulation.

The data obtained were analyzed using an interactive model analysis from Miles and Huberman with the following stages: data collection (data collection), data reduction (data reduction), data presentation (data display), and drawing conclusions or verification (conclusions). Miles and Huberman stated that activities in data analysis can be carried out interactively and take place continuously until the data obtained are complete and finally the data is saturated (Sugiyono, 2011).

In order to obtain valid and accountable research findings, it is necessary to test the validity of the data. According to Wahyu (2012), to test the validity of the data, it can be used to test the credibility of the data, which includes the extension of observations, increasing persistence, and triangulation

## DISCUSSION

As one element in the implementation of the education system in schools, teachers have a very important role in shaping, fostering and achieving educational outcomes. In teaching

and learning activities, a teacher is required to be creative to be able to create a pleasant learning atmosphere. One of them is creativity in making learning media.

The results of this study found that PPKn teachers at SMP Negeri 2 Kusan Hilir were very creative teachers in making learning media. This is known from the results of interviews with the Head of SMPN 2 Kusan Hilir School that Ks is one of the supervisors for the driving teacher in Tanah Bumbu Regency. As a mentor, the driving teacher must have special skills in managing learning media in the classroom and according to him, Mr. Ks is the right person for that. A similar statement came from the old school principal, J, and he also said that Ks is a very creative Civics teacher in creating various learning media, and have received many awards and contributed to the school.

The researcher then conducted direct interviews with Mr. Ks. He said that in carrying out learning always refers to the lesson plans that have been made. He went on to say "in making lesson plans I often include innovative learning media and are made on my own creativity."

The role of teacher creativity is certainly not just helping the teaching and learning process by covering only one aspect of the human being, but includes other aspects, namely cognitive, psychomotor and affective. The importance of teacher creativity in learning, among others: (1) teacher creativity



is useful in transferring information more fully, (2) teacher creativity is useful in stimulating students to think more scientifically in observing social phenomena or natural phenomena that are the object of study in learning, (3) Teacher's creativity products will stimulate students' creativity (Oktavia, 2020). Creative teachers are motivators for their students (Oktiani, 2017). As the results of research conducted by (Yurida, Damopolii & Erari 2021) which concluded that student learning motivation in the future is related to the creativity of the teacher's teaching. Teachers with good creativity can make their students well motivated. The results of a similar study were also stated by (Hidayati & Ghofar 2022) that by using media, learning can be fun.

Ks further explains Some of the learning media that have been made include: (1) learning media for Children's Moral Character Control Tree (Pokemon). The purpose of using this media is to train students' thinking skills by applying honest behavior; (2) Batewah learning media. This media is the same as the traditional children's game in the Hulu Sungai Selatan area, namely by arranging the cans as high as possible. In this media, students are required to arrange cans according to the order of legislation according to Law Number 12 of 2011; (3) constitution-themed song media whose purpose is to introduce the state constitution; (4) ethnic diversity media made using old newspapers. The goal is for students

to easily recognize the diversity of ethnic groups in Indonesia; and (5) picture guessing media.

Mr. Ks is the only PPKn teacher at SMP Negeri 2 Kusan Hilir who has been teaching since 2008. As a Civics teacher, Ks is able to realize innovative and creative learning through the creation of various learning media. Creativity is defined as the ability to look at things from a different perspective and be able to find solutions and make choices (Ata-Akturk & Sevimli-Celik, 2020). In addition, creativity consists of innovations and inventions made in an original and useful way to produce something new by using something that already exists (Hidayat et al., 2021). Innovations made can make learning more meaningful. Therefore, teacher creativity plays an important role in the learning development process (Sefriyanti & Ibrahim, 2022).

In connection with the Civics learning that has been carried out so far, Ks explained that there are The three stages of the learning process carried out are (1) conducting preliminary activities by opening greetings and directing students to prepare themselves physically and psychologically, praying, and checking student attendance. The teacher provides motivation to be enthusiastic about participating in learning, conducts apperception through question and answer to students about learning materials, then conveys learning objectives as well as teaching materials and directions for subsequent

learning activities; (2) The core activity stage is an important stage in the Civics learning process. At this stage, the teacher conveys the material using learning media; (3) The final activity, the teacher and students conclude the lesson and give homework either individually or in groups. Besides that,

Based on the Ks explanation, the researcher then saw one of the RPP documents made. Based on the lesson plan, one of the learning media made is Batewah. The tools and materials needed are: Used cans (milk cans) 8 pieces, stickers that have been printed out, scissors and a hammer 1 piece. Steps for making Batewah media

1. Prepare tools and materials, namely milk cans, statutory order stickers, scissors and a hammer
2. Clean the milk can by removing the trademark sticker and cleaning the inside of the can with water until clean
3. Smooth the top of the open can with a hammer
4. Cut the sticker and stick it on the can
5. Stick the sticker on the can
6. The media can already be used for the Batewah game

Ks explained that the way to play Batewah is as follows:

1. Provide one piece of wood/ball and props
2. Prepare 4 – 10 players and 1 observer (can be from the teacher or students)
3. Players determine the losing participants by hompimpah / lottery

4. The losing participants arrange the cans according to the order of the legislation according to Law Number 12 of 2011 (observers state true and false in the arrangement made) until they are declared correct
5. Winning participants line up 4 meters from the cans (subject to agreement)
6. The winning participants take turns throwing wood/balls into the cans until they collapse
7. The losing participant rearranges the cans until they are correct
8. The other participants are hiding
9. When they have finished arranging, the students who were on guard look for students who are hiding one by one while keeping the arrangement of the cans.
10. When finding a student who is hiding, he must say his name while touching the arrangement of the cans.
11. But if any of the students who are hiding are able to knock down the wooden arrangement, the others hide back as before.
12. If all the students are able to find it, then the first student found will have a turn to guard or arrange the pieces of wood and so on until the game is declared to have stopped according to the agreement.

Regarding Civics learning with learning media made by Ks, one of the students, Na stated that "Mr Ks's way of teaching is unique, and it is easy for us to understand Civics

materials with the media he uses. For example, to introduce traditional clothes, he made various samples of traditional clothes from old newspapers, and we were also involved." A similar statement was also made by Dw "The material presented by Mr. Ks is very easy for us to understand." The other students are FS added that "it is very easy to understand KDP material with the media used by Mr. Ks, sometimes it's just time constraints." Thus it can be concluded that by using the media, learning is easier for students to understand. The results of this study are in line with the results of Tafonao's research (2018) which concluded that through learning media can make the teaching and learning process more effective and efficient and establish good relations between teachers and students. In addition, the media can play a role in overcoming boredom in learning in the classroom. The role of learning media in strengthening learning civics education in elementary schools is to clarify the presentation of messages so that they are not too verbal (Rahmanda & Maharani, 2022). The use of instructional media also helps students to absorb the same material as others, giving rise to the same perception between students and helping students to understand the material presented by students (Audie, 2019).

By understanding the material, it will certainly affect the achievement of learning outcomes. As stated by Mr. that "if it is a daily test or a semester test, I am easy to answer. He

also always gives us the opportunity to ask questions if there are things we don't understand, until we really understand." In addition to making it easier for students to understand the material presented, the use of learning media can also increase students' interest in participating in learning. As stated by one of the students, namely Dw who stated that "Mr. Ks made us wait for the Civics subject, we didn't want any free hours for the Civics subject. The learning media used are varied, and easy for us to practice. I like it the most if he uses Pokemon media, because there are games."

Making students feel at a loss if the teacher does not come to class is certainly not an easy thing. Most students if the teacher does not come to class, they feel happy. However, this does not apply to Mr. Ks, because students actually feel a loss if the PPKn lesson, Mr. Ks is unable to attend. It can be said that students' interest in participating in Civics learning is quite high.

This finding is in accordance with the results of research conducted by (Sunami & Aslam 2015) which in one of the conclusions of his research states that there is an effect of using instructional media on student interest in learning PAI. The results of a similar study were also stated by (Nurgiansyah 2022) that there was an increase in interest in learning by using conventional learning media. The use of conventional media is applied because modern learning media cannot be done. Even so,



students' learning interest in participating in Citizenship Education learning is getting better.

## 5 CONCLUSION

From this research, it can be concluded that PPKn teachers at SMP Negeri 2 Kusan Hilir, Tanah Bumbu Regency are very creative in making learning media. Some media peThe lessons that have been made include: Child Moral Control Tree media, Banjar Batewah traditional game media, constitution-themed song media, ethnic diversity media through used newspapers, and picture guessing media. Students are quite enthusiastic in participating in PPKn learning. This is because teachers always use varied learning media

## REFERENCES

- [1] Anggraeni, A. (2019). The Urgency of Implementing a Constructivism Approach in Elementary Civics Learning to Increase Students' Interest in Learning. *Pelita Nation Preserving Pancasila*, 14(2).
- [2] Audie, N. (2019, May). The role of learning media in improving student learning outcomes. In *Proceedings of the National Seminar on FKIP Education (Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 586-595)*.
- [3] Ata-Akturk, A., & Sevimli-Celik, S. (2020). Creativity in early childhood teacher education: beliefs and practices. *International Journal of Early Years Education*, 0(0), 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669760.2020.175417>
- [4] Gawise, G., Jamin, MV, & Azizah, FN (2022). The Role of Learning Media in Strengthening Citizenship Education Learning in Elementary Schools. *EDUCATION: JOURNAL OF EDUCATIONAL SCIENCES*, 4(3), 3575-3581.
- [5] Kartono, K. (2017). The Influence of Students' Interest and Learning Motivation on Learning Achievement in Civic Education. *Factor: Scientific Journal of Education*, 4(3), 241-250.
- [6] Kunandar (2011). *Professional Teacher : Implementation of Education Unit Level Curriculum*
- [7] Nurgiansah, TH (2022). Increasing Students' Interest in Learning with Conventional Learning Media in Citizenship Education Learning. *Journal of Education and Counseling*, 4(3), 1529-1534.
- [8] Nurhasanah, S., & Sobandi, A. (2016). Interest in learning as a determinant of student learning outcomes. *Journal of Office Management Education (JPManper)*, 1(1), 128-135.
- [9] Prianggita, VA, & Melyawati, M. (2022). The Role of Information and Communication Technology-Based Learning Media in the Era of the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Aksara: Journal of Non-Formal Education*, 8(1), 147-154.
- [10] Hartini, A. (2022). The Influence of the Role of Learning Media on Student Achievement at MIS Hidayatullah Aluh-Aluh Banjar Regency. *Widya Accarya*, 13(1), 82-91.
- [11] Hidayat, H., Nurfadilah, A., Khoerussadah, E., and Fauziyyah, N. (2021). Increasing teacher creativity in early childhood learning in the digital era. *Journal of Early Childhood Education*, 10 (2), 97–103. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21831/jpa.v10i2.37063>
- [12] Hidayat, Heri (2020). The Role of Technology and Learning Media for Elementary School Students in Citizenship Education Learning. *Journal of Civics Undiksha*, 8(2), 1–9
- [13] Hidayati, N., & Ghofar, A. (2022, July). Improving Student Motivation in Online Learning at SMK Muhammadiyah 2 Wates. In *the National Seminar on Implementation Results of the School Field Introduction Program (Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 221-228)*.
- [14] Irdianti, PR, Mahadewi, LPP, & Widiana, IW (2020). Relationship between Learning Interest and Empathy Behavior on PKN Learning Outcomes. *Journal of Pedagogy and Learning*, 3(3), 459-472.
- [15] Oktavia, Y. (2020). The Principal's Efforts in Improving Teacher Creativity in Learning in Elementary Schools. *Journal of Educational Management Materials*, 2(1), 808-815.
- [16] Oktiani, I. (2017). Teacher creativity in increasing students' learning motivation. *Journal of education*, 5(2), 216-232.
- [17] Rahmanda & Maharani (2022) that the media does not cause boredom when learning in

- class and is able to increase motivation in the learning process
- [18] Sanistyasari, IGAN, Putra, M., & Suniasih, NW (2019). The Influence of the Fantasy Field Trip Method in the School Environment Assisted by Wall Magazine Media on Civics Knowledge Competence. *Indonesian Journal of Social Studies Education*, 3(1), 21-31.
- [19] Sefriyanti, S., & Ibrahim, I. (2022). The Influence of Teacher Creativity on Cognitive Ability of Children aged 5-6 Years at RA Azzahra, East Lampung. *Journal of Children's Education*, 11(1), 1-9.
- [20] Suda, IK (2016). The Importance of Media in Improving the Quality of Student Learning in Elementary Schools. *Indonesian Hindu University*.
- [21] Sugiyono. 2011. *Research Methods Quantitative, Qualitative, and R & D*. Bandung Alfabeta.
- [22] Sunami, MA, & Aslam, A. (2021). The effect of using zoom meeting-based animated video learning media on the interest and learning outcomes of elementary school students in science. *Journal of Basicedu*, 5(4), 1940-1945.
- [23] Sumardjoko, B., & Musyiam, M. (2018). Model of civic education learning based on the local wisdom for revitalizing values of Pancasila. *Journal of Education Horizon*, 37(2).
- [24] Supriyono, S. (2018). The Importance of Learning Media to Increase Student Interest in Elementary School. *Edustream: Journal of Basic Education*, 2(1), 43-48.
- [25] Tafonao, T. (2018). The role of learning media in increasing student interest in learning. *Journal of Educational Communication*, 2(2), 103-114.
- [26] Taukhid, H. (2016). Increasing Interest and Learning Outcomes of Civics through Contextual Learning with Community Learning Techniques for Fifth Grade Students at Babadan State Elementary School in Semester 2 of the 2015/2016 Academic Year. *Reflection on Education: Scientific Journal of Education*, 6(2).
- [27] Widiatmaka, P. (2016). Nationalism character building of students in Islamic-based schools. *JPK (Journal of Pancasila and Citizenship)*, 1(1), 25-33.
- [28] Wahyu, et al. 2012. *Guidelines for Writing Scientific Papers*. Banjarmasin: Aswaja Pressindo
- [29] Wahyuningtyas, R., & Sulasmono, BS (2020). The importance of media in learning to improve learning outcomes in elementary schools. *Educational: Journal of Educational Sciences*, 2(1), 23-27.
- [30] Yurida, Y., Damopolii, I., & Erari, SS (2021). The relationship between teacher creativity and students' motivation to learn science during the COVID-19 pandemic. In *Proceedings of SNPBS (National Seminar on Biology and Science and Technology Education)* (pp. 146-152).

# Jurnal 4

---

## ORIGINALITY REPORT

---

23%

SIMILARITY INDEX

22%

INTERNET SOURCES

11%

PUBLICATIONS

9%

STUDENT PAPERS

---

## PRIMARY SOURCES

---

1	Submitted to Universitas Prima Indonesia Student Paper	3%
2	repository.uinsu.ac.id Internet Source	2%
3	jurnal.upmk.ac.id Internet Source	1%
4	journal.unismuh.ac.id Internet Source	1%
5	repository.um-surabaya.ac.id Internet Source	1%
6	repository.unisma.ac.id Internet Source	1%
7	jurnal.arkainstitute.co.id Internet Source	1%
8	Eli Yuliansih, Yasir Arafat, Achmad Wahidy. "The influence of learning media and learning interests on student learning outcomes", JPGI (Jurnal Penelitian Guru Indonesia), 2021 Publication	1%

---

9	<a href="https://files.eric.ed.gov">files.eric.ed.gov</a> Internet Source	1 %
10	<a href="https://media.neliti.com">media.neliti.com</a> Internet Source	1 %
11	<a href="http://www.jurnal.iicet.org">www.jurnal.iicet.org</a> Internet Source	1 %
12	<a href="http://www.bircu-journal.com">www.bircu-journal.com</a> Internet Source	1 %
13	<a href="http://journalppw.com">journalppw.com</a> Internet Source	1 %
14	<a href="http://www.researchgate.net">www.researchgate.net</a> Internet Source	1 %
15	<a href="http://repo.uinsatu.ac.id">repo.uinsatu.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1 %
16	Suryaningsi Suryaningsi, Nurlaili Nurlaili, Meiliyani Siringoringo, Widyatmike Gede Mulawarman. "How does the principal's policy respond to professional learning during the COVID-19 pandemic?", <i>Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences</i> , 2022 Publication	1 %
17	<a href="http://www.edunesia.org">www.edunesia.org</a> Internet Source	1 %
18	<a href="http://bircu-journal.com">bircu-journal.com</a> Internet Source	1 %

19	<a href="http://ejal.info">ejal.info</a> Internet Source	1 %
20	Septinaningrum, Kama Abdul Hakam, Wawan Setiawan, Mubiar Agustin. "Developing of Augmented Reality Media Containing Grebeg Pancasila for Character Learning in Elementary School", Ingénierie des systèmes d information, 2022 Publication	1 %
21	<a href="http://jurnal.fkip.unmul.ac.id">jurnal.fkip.unmul.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1 %
22	<a href="http://ijisrt.com">ijisrt.com</a> Internet Source	1 %
23	<a href="http://int-jecse.net">int-jecse.net</a> Internet Source	1 %

Exclude quotes  On

Exclude bibliography  Off

Exclude matches  < 1%