

---

## [Agriculture] Manuscript ID: agriculture-1840239 - Major Revisions - Due Date: 21 September

14 messages

---

**Agriculture Editorial Office** <agriculture@mdpi.com>

Wed, Sep 14, 2022 at 10:37 AM

Reply-To: tarrah.zhang@mdpi.com

To: Heather Mary Burrow <heather.burrow@une.edu.au>

Cc: Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>, Tri Satya Mastuti Widi <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>, Agriculture Editorial Office <agriculture@mdpi.com>

Dear Professor Burrow,

Thank you again for your manuscript submission:

Manuscript ID: agriculture-1840239

Type of manuscript: Review

Title: Promoting sustainable utilization and genetic improvement of Indonesian local beef cattle breeds: a review

Authors: Nuzul Widyas \*, Tri Satya Mastuti Widi, Sigit Prastowo, Ika Sumantri, Ben J. Hayes, Heather M Burrow

Received: 14 July 2022

E-mails: [nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id), [prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id), [widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id](mailto:widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id), [isumantri@ulm.ac.id](mailto:isumantri@ulm.ac.id), [b.hayes@uq.edu.au](mailto:b.hayes@uq.edu.au), [heather.burrow@une.edu.au](mailto:heather.burrow@une.edu.au)

Submitted to section: Farm Animal Production,

[https://www.mdpi.com/journal/agriculture/sections/Farm\\_animal\\_production](https://www.mdpi.com/journal/agriculture/sections/Farm_animal_production)

Application of Genetics and Genomics in Livestock Production

[https://www.mdpi.com/journal/agriculture/special\\_issues/livestock\\_genetics](https://www.mdpi.com/journal/agriculture/special_issues/livestock_genetics)

Your manuscript has now been reviewed by experts in the field. Please find your manuscript with the referee reports at this link:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/resubmit/6eb08c22abb430b85cd025483c46934f>

Please revise the manuscript according to the referees' comments and upload the revised file within 7 days.

Please use the version of your manuscript found at the above link for your revisions.

- (I) Please check that all references are relevant to the contents of the manuscript.
- (II) Any revisions to the manuscript should be \*marked up\* using the "Track Changes" function if you are using MS Word/LaTeX, such that any changes can be easily viewed by the editors and reviewers.
- (III) Please provide a \*cover letter\* to explain, \*point by point\*, the details of the revisions to the manuscript and your responses to the referees' comments.
- (IV) If you found it impossible to address certain comments in the review reports, please include an explanation in your rebuttal.
- (V) The revised version will be sent to the editors and reviewers.

If one of the referees has suggested that your manuscript should undergo extensive English revisions, please address this issue during revision. We propose that you use one of the editing services listed at <https://www.mdpi.com/authors/english> or have your manuscript checked by a native English-speaking colleague.

Do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions regarding the revision of your manuscript. We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Kind regards,  
Ms. Tarrah Zhang  
E-Mail: [tarrah.zhang@mdpi.com](mailto:tarrah.zhang@mdpi.com)  
--  
MDPI Office

MDPI Agriculture Editorial Office  
St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland  
E-Mail: [agriculture@mdpi.com](mailto:agriculture@mdpi.com)  
<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/agriculture>

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.

---

**Heather Burrow** <[hburrow2@une.edu.au](mailto:hburrow2@une.edu.au)> Wed, Sep 14, 2022 at 10:56 AM  
To: Nuzul Widyas <[nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id)>, Tri Satya Mastuti Widi <[prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id)>, Sigit Prastowo <[widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id](mailto:widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id)>, Ika Sumantri <[isumantri@ulm.ac.id](mailto:isumantri@ulm.ac.id)>, "Ben J. Hayes" <[b.hayes@uq.edu.au](mailto:b.hayes@uq.edu.au)>

Dear all

I have skimmed through the new comments provided by Referee 1 and they seem to be straightforward, except for a request for additional information about specific issues (e.g. the Bali progeny test program) ... how about I have a first go at addressing these comments and then get back to you with specific issues that require an Indonesian perspective??? I will probably only be able to get a revised version to you over the weekend, but that should still allow plenty of time for the remainder of the changes - would that work???

Kind regards

Heather

-----Original Message-----

From: [tarrah.zhang@mdpi.com](mailto:tarrah.zhang@mdpi.com) <[tarrah.zhang@mdpi.com](mailto:tarrah.zhang@mdpi.com)> On Behalf Of Agriculture Editorial Office  
Sent: Wednesday, 14 September 2022 12:38 PM  
To: Heather Burrow <[heather.burrow@une.edu.au](mailto:heather.burrow@une.edu.au)>  
Cc: Nuzul Widyas <[nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id)>; Tri Satya Mastuti Widi <[prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id)>; Sigit Prastowo <[widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id](mailto:widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id)>; Ika Sumantri <[isumantri@ulm.ac.id](mailto:isumantri@ulm.ac.id)>; Ben J. Hayes <[b.hayes@uq.edu.au](mailto:b.hayes@uq.edu.au)>; Agriculture Editorial Office <[agriculture@mdpi.com](mailto:agriculture@mdpi.com)>  
Subject: [Agriculture] Manuscript ID: agriculture-1840239 - Major Revisions - Due Date: 21 September

Dear Professor Burrow,

Thank you again for your manuscript submission:

Manuscript ID: agriculture-1840239

Type of manuscript: Review

Title: Promoting sustainable utilization and genetic improvement of Indonesian local beef cattle breeds: a review

Authors: Nuzul Widyas \*, Tri Satya Mastuti Widi, Sigit Prastowo, Ika Sumantri, Ben J. Hayes, Heather M Burrow

Received: 14 July 2022

E-mails: [nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id), [prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id), [widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id](mailto:widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id), [isumantri@ulm.ac.id](mailto:isumantri@ulm.ac.id), [b.hayes@uq.edu.au](mailto:b.hayes@uq.edu.au), [heather.burrow@une.edu.au](mailto:heather.burrow@une.edu.au) Submitted to section: Farm Animal Production,

[https://aus01.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.mdpi.com%2Fjournal%2Fagriculture%2Fsections%2FFarm\\_animal\\_production&data=05%7C01%7Chburrow2%40myune.mail.onmicrosoft.com%7C19e8c52b972b44ff5f5108da95fa1b9f%7C3e104c4f8ef24d1483d8bd7d3b46b8db%7C0%7C0%7C637987198687706299%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWljoIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik](https://aus01.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.mdpi.com%2Fjournal%2Fagriculture%2Fsections%2FFarm_animal_production&data=05%7C01%7Chburrow2%40myune.mail.onmicrosoft.com%7C19e8c52b972b44ff5f5108da95fa1b9f%7C3e104c4f8ef24d1483d8bd7d3b46b8db%7C0%7C0%7C637987198687706299%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWljoIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik)

1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C3000%7C%7C%7C&sdata=ikG3LGPznRd%2FGQdUVv%2Bh4fotYAAP0Wj4Qb5m%2FNGBIDE%3D&reserved=0

Application of Genetics and Genomics in Livestock Production

[https://aus01.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.mdpi.com%2Fjournal%2Fagriculture%2Fspecial\\_issues%2Flivestock\\_genetics&data=05%7C01%7CChburrow2%40myune.mail.onmicrosoft.com%7C19e8c52b972b4fff5f5108da95fa1b9f%7C3e104c4f8ef24d1483d8bd7d3b46b8db%7C0%7C0%7C637987198687706299%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWljoic4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzliLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C3000%7C%7C%7C&sdata=ZzKKMYQlaxDYsyca%2FMkBPxcu6V9fnywgRRS%2B8%2BnbVHY%3D&reserved=0](https://aus01.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.mdpi.com%2Fjournal%2Fagriculture%2Fspecial_issues%2Flivestock_genetics&data=05%7C01%7CChburrow2%40myune.mail.onmicrosoft.com%7C19e8c52b972b4fff5f5108da95fa1b9f%7C3e104c4f8ef24d1483d8bd7d3b46b8db%7C0%7C0%7C637987198687706299%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWljoic4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzliLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C3000%7C%7C%7C&sdata=ZzKKMYQlaxDYsyca%2FMkBPxcu6V9fnywgRRS%2B8%2BnbVHY%3D&reserved=0)

Your manuscript has now been reviewed by experts in the field. Please find your manuscript with the referee reports at this link:

<https://aus01.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.mdpi.com%2Fuser%2Fmanuscripts%2Fsubmit%2F6eb08c22abb430b85cd025483c46934f&data=05%7C01%7CChburrow2%40myune.mail.onmicrosoft.com%7C19e8c52b972b4fff5f5108da95fa1b9f%7C3e104c4f8ef24d1483d8bd7d3b46b8db%7C0%7C0%7C637987198687706299%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWljoic4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzliLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C3000%7C%7C%7C&sdata=dEQF7RgW5wGf%2FZ8g5qbFUQbNA%2BPjcD1DN6mE6zBVjs%3D&reserved=0>

Please revise the manuscript according to the referees' comments and upload the revised file within 7 days.

Please use the version of your manuscript found at the above link for your revisions.

- (I) Please check that all references are relevant to the contents of the manuscript.
- (II) Any revisions to the manuscript should be \*marked up\* using the "Track Changes" function if you are using MS Word/LaTeX, such that any changes can be easily viewed by the editors and reviewers.
- (III) Please provide a \*cover letter\* to explain, \*point by point\*, the details of the revisions to the manuscript and your responses to the referees' comments.
- (IV) If you found it impossible to address certain comments in the review reports, please include an explanation in your rebuttal.
- (V) The revised version will be sent to the editors and reviewers.

If one of the referees has suggested that your manuscript should undergo extensive English revisions, please address this issue during revision. We propose that you use one of the editing services listed at

<https://aus01.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.mdpi.com%2Fauthors%2Fenglish&data=05%7C01%7CChburrow2%40myune.mail.onmicrosoft.com%7C19e8c52b972b4fff5f5108da95fa1b9f%7C3e104c4f8ef24d1483d8bd7d3b46b8db%7C0%7C0%7C637987198687706299%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWljoic4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzliLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C3000%7C%7C%7C&sdata=AAAwRTnrlnzv%2FvYYbc%2FZfG%2FO4AFx6y51wQ8Y53EIdmQ%3D&reserved=0> or have your manuscript checked by a native English-speaking colleague.

Do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions regarding the revision of your manuscript. We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Kind regards,  
Ms. Tarrah Zhang  
E-Mail: [tarrah.zhang@mdpi.com](mailto:tarrah.zhang@mdpi.com)

--  
MDPI Office

MDPI Agriculture Editorial Office  
St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland  
E-Mail: [agriculture@mdpi.com](mailto:agriculture@mdpi.com)

<https://aus01.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.mdpi.com%2Fjournal%2Fagriculture&data=05%7C01%7CChburrow2%40myune.mail.onmicrosoft.com%7C19e8c52b972b4fff5f5108da95fa1b9f%7C3e104c4f8ef24d1483d8bd7d3b46b8db%7C0%7C0%7C637987198687706299%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWljoic4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzliLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C3000%7C%7C%7C&sdata=irMY9afwE70JGnrbEAJQ%2FMNE3TPUqrGD5i9jkRAM4A4%3D&reserved=0>

[Quoted text hidden]

Cc: Tri Satya Mastuti Widi <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Sure Bu Heather,  
We will be waiting for your version and work accordingly.

Regards,  
Nuzul Widyas

*Animal Breeding and Reproduction Group  
Dept. of Animal Science  
Sebelas Maret University  
Indonesia  
email: [nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id)*

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Heather Burrow** <hburrow2@une.edu.au> Wed, Sep 14, 2022 at 11:08 AM  
To: Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>  
Cc: Tri Satya Mastuti Widi <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Thanks bu Nuzul – that will hopefully work well!

Kind regards

Heather

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Heather Burrow** <hburrow2@une.edu.au> Sun, Sep 18, 2022 at 1:09 PM  
To: Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>  
Cc: Tri Satya Mastuti Widi <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Dear all

I have now been through the reviewer's feedback and responded to that feedback as per the attached latest version of the paper and the responses file. Most of the suggestions have simply been adhered to, but I have chosen not to change sections responding to the reviewer's demand (rather than suggestion!) that the description of the origin of Bali cattle be changed because it is clear there are different versions of their origin, with authors of the various accounts simply making statements rather than actually providing evidence of why the cattle have been classified one way or another. Rather than our paper starting a debate on a topic that is unrelated to why the paper was prepared (and I at least having no ability to make a judgement in favour of one perspective over another), I have simply responded ...

*It is clear the origins of these Indonesian cattle breeds are still to be unequivocally determined, because the authoritative publications we use as our source of information [i.e. MSD AGVET (1985) "Genus Bos: Cattle Breeds of the World." Copyright Merck & Co., Inc, published by MSD AGVET, Rathway, N.J., USA and Payne, W.J.A. and Hodges, John (1977) "Tropical Cattle: Origins, Breeds and Breeding Policies." Blackwell Science Ltd, Oxford, UK] provide a different explanation to those additional reputable publications cited by the reviewer. Due to the uncertainty of their origins and rather than accepting one or the other of the alternate interpretations, we have double checked all our citations of Bos bibos and ensured each mention of the origins of the cattle includes terms such as "... are believed to have possibly ...", "are hypothesized to have ...", "were initially believed to be ..." and "could have been derived ..."*

*We have chosen to take this approach because the focus of our manuscript is not on proving or disproving their origins, but rather on the conservation and genetic improvement of the existing Indonesian cattle breeds. However, we are also keen to ensure the readers understand that those breeds are unique by way of their evolution. Hence, we hope our approach will satisfy the reviewer, the journal and the readers of our paper, because we also do not want to distract those readers away from the main purpose of the review by raising the discrepancies in belief about their origins as a major focus of the paper.*

There may well be a more diplomatic way of handling this issue, so your further suggestions on this response (as well as all other responses!) would be useful please ...

Additionally please note that I have made a claim for the current consortium to sequence the Indonesian cattle breeds (*We are currently exploring opportunities through Indonesian and international agencies to sequence the unique Indonesian cattle breeds and enable this comparison.*) This to potentially defer the reviewer from seeing an opportunity (just in case!)

Hopefully if the reviewer comes back with further changes the journal will buy into the debate and indicate that many of the suggestions made by the reviewer are pedantic and were not required by the other two reviewers to interpret the paper!

Kind regards

Heather

**From:** Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, 14 September 2022 1:05 PM  
**To:** Heather Burrow <hburrow2@une.edu.au>

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

---

## 2 attachments

 **agriculture-1840239.docx**  
2911K

 **Responses to Reviewer 1's further suggestions.docx**  
50K

---

**Heather Burrow** <hburrow2@une.edu.au> Sun, Sep 18, 2022 at 1:19 PM  
To: Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>  
Cc: Tri Satya Mastuti Widi <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Sorry all – I should have mentioned that one option to the origins of Bali cattle would have been to use one or more of the additional references suggested by the reviewer to highlight the different opinions, but that would then mean having to go through the entire paper and re-number the references and that was something I was hoping we could avoid if possible!!!

Kind regards

Heather

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Heather Burrow** <hburrow2@une.edu.au>

Mon, Sep 19, 2022 at 6:33 AM

To: Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>

Cc: Tri Satya Mastuti Widi <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Dear all

Some further information that might help you provide suggestions on how we best manage the reviewers' comments on the origins of Bali cattle! The reviewer is insisting that ...

**Banteng is incorrectly cited as *Bos bibos* in few papers, but it is because its genus name “Bos” has historically accompanied by the subgenus name “Bibos”. Anyway, Bibos can be indicated in the scientific name only as “Bos (Bibos) javanicus”**

However Payne and Hodges (1997) were clear in their book on the origins of tropical cattle that “*Bos javanicus* (Bali cattle) and *Bos banteng* (Banteng cattle) ... each evolved from *Bos bibos* ancestors, but independently of these other breed types [21].” (though they did not provide supporting evidence for their statement ... however, if they are correct, then it is likely that the Banteng cattle studied in Thailand – but also without providing support on their origins - may be different to the domesticated Bali cattle in Indonesia – hence I don't believe it would be correct for us to simply refer to the cattle as *Bos (Bibos) javanicus* as recommended by the reviewer because we have no evidence that is correct either!) To save you all having to go to the papers recommended by the reviewer, I have downloaded all of them and determined that none of those papers makes any attempt to present evidence in support of their stated origins of the Banteng cattle used in their studies (like us, that was not the purpose of any of those papers!) Hence, it is still my conclusion that our original references are most likely to present an accurate description of the origin of the Bali and Madura breeds because those publications were focused entirely on differentiating different breeds of cattle (though again, they did not present supporting evidence to support their statements) ... I have attached one of the papers suggested by the reviewer which reported on Indonesian cattle and also extracted the relevant information from it in my assessment of all the papers recommended by the reviewer below ...

Rahman, D. A., Herliansyah, R., Rianti, P., Rahmat, U. M., Firdaus, A. Y., & Syamsudin, M. (2019). Ecology and conservation of the Endangered banteng (*Bos javanicus*) in Indonesia tropical lowland forest. *Hayati Journal of Biosciences*, 26(2), 68-68. **No attempt is made to determine whether these Banteng cattle are the same domesticated Bali cattle in Indonesia and nor is any evidence presented to support the statements about their origin (see attached paper and the following extract)**

The natural history and conservation need of many tropical forests of ungulates are poorly known, particularly in *Bos javanicus* (banteng). This lack of knowledge is heavily impacted by the conversion and degradation of lowland forests and illegal hunting, commercial trade, and bush-meat consumption (Nowak 1999; Di Marco *et al.* 2014). Banteng has its crucial function in ecosystems as dispersal vectors of plant propagules and nutrients (Bakker *et al.* 2015), key modifiers and maintainers of ecosystem dynamics and habitat complexity (Jones *et al.* 1994; Waldram *et al.* 2008), as well as prey for medium to large carnivores (Mondal *et al.* 2012; Pudyatmoko 2018; Rahman *et al.* 2018).

Banteng is a primitive ungulate with three subspecies and now are habituating the forests of Borneo, Java, and Bali in Indonesia. This species came from the mainland of Southeast Asia, particularly in Yunnan, Southern China through Peninsular Malaysia (Timmins *et al.* 2008). Today, banteng is extinct in South Malaysia, Bangladesh, and India (Medway 1969).

Chaichanathong, S., Klinsawat, W., Sukmak, M., Sakulthai, A., Wajjwalku, W., Sripiboon, S., ... & Thongtip, N. (2021). Genetic characterization of banteng (*Bos javanicus*) populations in Thailand for conservation. *The Thai Journal of*

*Veterinary Medicine*, 51(4), 647-654. *No attempt is made to determine whether these cattle in Thailand are the same as those in Indonesia and nor is any evidence presented to support the stated origins of the cattle.*

Chaiyarat, R., Youngpoy, N., Kongsurakan, P., & Nakbun, S. (2019). Habitat preferences of reintroduced banteng (*Bos javanicus*) into the Salakphra Wildlife Sanctuary, Thailand. *Wildlife Research*, 46(7), 573-586. *No attempt is made to determine whether these cattle in Thailand are the same as those in Indonesia and nor is any evidence presented to support the stated origins of the cattle.*

Gillis, J. D., Holt, W. V., Yon, L., Woad, K. J., Love, D., Holly, R., & Penfold, L. M. (2022). How can mating systems inform future biobanking strategies? An illustration using two Indonesian bovines, banteng (*Bos javanicus*) and lowland anoa (*Bubalus depressicornis*). *Animal Reproduction Science*, 238, 106943. *Examined semen for its similarity to other bovine species – made no attempt to prove the origins of the breeds with evidence to support the stated origins of the cattle*


Kongsurakan, P., Chaiyarat, R., Nakbun, S., Thongthip, N., & Anuracpreeda, P. (2020). Monitoring body condition score of reintroduced banteng (*Bos javanicus* D'Alton, 1923) into Salakphra Wildlife Sanctuary, Thailand. *PeerJ*, 8, e9041. *No attempt is made to determine whether these cattle in Thailand are the same as those in Indonesia and nor is any evidence presented to support the stated origins of the cattle.*

Phoonjampa, R., Steinmetz, R., Phumanee, W., Bunchornratana, K., Kaewsrison, T., Srirattanaporn, S., ... & Bhumpakphan, N. (2021). Recolonization of Former Range by Endangered Banteng *Bos javanicus* in Mae Wong National Park, Thailand. *Tropical Conservation Science*, 14, 19400829211065359. *No attempt is made to determine whether these cattle in Thailand are the same as those in Indonesia and nor is any evidence presented to support the stated origins of the cattle.*

So happy to take your best recommendations on how we deal with this point from the reviewer!!!

[Quoted text hidden]

---

 **27981-Article Text-87359-1-10-20191027 - Rahman et al 2019.pdf**  
885K

---

**Heather Burrow** <hburrow2@une.edu.au>

Mon, Sep 19, 2022 at 9:32 AM

To: Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>, Tri Satya Mastuti Widi <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Dear all

From the reminder we just received, it seems the journal is keen for us to re-submit our paper (that is good news, even though we still have until Wednesday to resubmit!) Hence, based on the earlier messages that I sent through, I have revised the response to the suggestion made by the reviewer that we use *Bos javanicus* (Banteng) in our paper and copied the latest response below ...

*It appears to us that the origins of these Indonesian cattle breeds are still to be unequivocally determined. The authoritative publications we use as our source of information are focused specifically on the origins of cattle, particularly of tropical cattle. They indicate*

*"Bos javanicus (Bali cattle) and Bos banteng (Banteng cattle) ... each evolved from Bos bibos ancestors, but independently of other [Bos taurus and Bos indicus] cattle."*

*However, those publications did not provide evidence to support their statements of this evolutionary history.*

*We have also checked each one of the references suggested by the reviewer and, while all of those studies report the use of Banteng cattle, the purpose of those studies (like our own study) was not aimed at proving the evolutionary*

*history of the cattle. Hence, as expected by us, those authors presented no evidence to prove or disprove routine statements regarding the breed of animals used. Nor did any of those studies attempt to determine whether the Banteng cattle used in those studies (most from Thailand) were the same species as the domesticated Bali cattle we have focused on in our review. If the Payne and Hodges (1977) book on the Origins of Tropical Cattle that we have cited is correct, then it is possible the Banteng cattle used in those studies may have a common evolutionary history but still be different to the Indonesian Bali cattle.*

*Due to the uncertainty of the origins of the cattle used in those references, as well as in our own study, we believe it is preferable not to accept the alternate interpretations, primarily because that is not the focus of our study. Rather, we have double checked all our citations of *Bos bibos* and ensured each citation mentions the origins of the cattle includes terms such as "... are believed to have possibly ...", "are hypothesized to have ...", "were initially believed to be ..." and "could have been derived ..."*

*However, we are also keen to ensure the readers of our paper understand the Bali and Madura breeds have a different evolutionary history to *Bos taurus* and *Bos indicus*. Hence, we hope our approach will satisfy the reviewer and the journal editor, as we are keen to ensure the readers of our paper are not distracted from the main topic to focus on possible discrepancies about their evolutionary history.*

Does this alternative wording work (as well as the wording of all other responses!)

Many thanks and kind regards

[Quoted text hidden]

---

## 2 attachments



**Responses to Reviewer 1's further suggestions.docx**  
50K



**agriculture-1840239.docx**  
2911K

---

**Sigit Prastowo** <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>

Mon, Sep 19, 2022 at 10:45 AM

To: Heather Burrow <hburrow2@une.edu.au>

Cc: Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Dear Bu Heather

I am agreed with your strategy in answering reviewer 1. In my opinion, the central point of the reviewer 1 concert is only about the Bali cattle taxonomy.

Other concerns are already answered in the revised manuscript.

If the reference list section needs to be reordered, it will not be an issue to rearrange bu...I would be ready to input in the reference software.

Regards  
Sigit Prastowo

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Heather Burrow** <hburrow2@une.edu.au>

Mon, Sep 19, 2022 at 10:50 AM

To: Sigit Prastowo <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>

Cc: Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>



Very many thanks Pak Sigit both for your response and also your offer to re-order the references if needed (though none of the additional references is really about taxonomy as you indicate, so hopefully that will not be necessary!)

Kind regards

Heather

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Nuzul Widyas** <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id> Mon, Sep 19, 2022 at 11:25 AM  
To: Heather Burrow <hburrow2@une.edu.au>  
Cc: Sigit Prastowo <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Dear all,  
The main problem is indeed reviewer 1 with the Bali cattle taxonomy and origin which is not the main interest of our paper; and I think Bu Heather has made a comprehensive response.  
I will need some time to read the enclosed documents thoroughly. I will come back to you most likely later in the evening.

Regards,  
Nuzul Widyas

*Animal Breeding and Reproduction Group  
Dept. of Animal Science  
Sebelas Maret University  
Indonesia  
email: [nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id)*

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Heather Burrow** <hburrow2@une.edu.au> Mon, Sep 19, 2022 at 11:31 AM  
To: Nuzul Widyas <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id>  
Cc: Sigit Prastowo <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Very many thanks Bu Nuzul – it is important that you do read our responses as many of the changes used your earlier suggestions, so you need to check that my wording is citing you correctly!

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Nuzul Widyas** <nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id> Tue, Sep 20, 2022 at 12:53 PM  
To: Heather Burrow <hburrow2@une.edu.au>  
Cc: Sigit Prastowo <prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id>, Sigit Prastowo <widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id>, Ika Sumantri <isumantri@ulm.ac.id>, "Ben J. Hayes" <b.hayes@uq.edu.au>

Dear Bu Heather,

We've read through the letter and checked the manuscript and I don't think we need to change anything. There are no changes in the reference as well so I think we are good to go.

Thank you.

Regards,  
Nuzul Widyas

*Animal Breeding and Reproduction Group  
Dept. of Animal Science*

*Sebelas Maret University  
Indonesia  
email: [nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id)*

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Heather Burrow** <[hburrow2@une.edu.au](mailto:hburrow2@une.edu.au)> Tue, Sep 20, 2022 at 1:15 PM  
To: Nuzul Widyas <[nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:nuzul.widyas@staff.uns.ac.id)>  
Cc: Sigit Prastowo <[prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:prastowo@staff.uns.ac.id)>, Sigit Prastowo <[widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id](mailto:widi.tsm@ugm.ac.id)>, Ika Sumantri <[isumantri@ulm.ac.id](mailto:isumantri@ulm.ac.id)>, "Ben J. Hayes" <[b.hayes@uq.edu.au](mailto:b.hayes@uq.edu.au)>

Great news bu Nuzul – thanks for your feedback ... I will upload the revised document and our responses now!

[Quoted text hidden]