

**[ESTP] Submission Acknowledgement****Editor in Chief** <editor@jestp.com>

Sat, Jan 29, 2022 at 10:25 AM

To: **Sunarno Basuki** <sunarno.basuki@ulm.ac.id>

Sunarno Basuki:

Thank you for submitting the manuscript, "THE ROLE OF THE PHYSICAL EDUCATION SUPERVISOR IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF HEALTHY CULTURE LIVING " to Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://jestp.com/index.php/estp/authorDashboard/submission/1636>

Username: sunarno

If your paper pass reviews processes and meets our standards it is necessary to make the payment.

**Publication fee** (covers: publishing, review, and databases indexing costs): **1500 USD**.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

---

[Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice](#)

**[ESTP] Revision request****Editor in Chief** <editor@jestp.com>

Tue, Mar 1, 2022 at 09:57 AM

To: **Sunarno Basuki** <sunarno.basuki@ulm.ac.id>

Sunarno Basuki:

The paper "THE ROLE OF THE PHYSICAL EDUCATION SUPERVISOR IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF HEALTHY CULTURE LIVING " has been preliminarily reviewed.

I regret to inform you, however, that the paper will not move forward to the peer-review process and be considered for publication on the Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice in the way it is.

The paper needs a deep reformulation for being considered for another review. The paper has no quality in the way it is to move forward. In case the authors provide all necessary improvements, the paper can be considered for a second review.

Some important considerations:

**Reviewer A**

While reviewing the manuscript, *The Role of The Physical Education Supervisor in The Development of Healthy Culture Living for Elementary School Students*, I found that the authors have tried to address an important issue. Nonetheless, I still have some other concerns that should be further addressed to make the study more influential

1. The introduction part is not well written and arranged as per the objectives of the study. However, I have the following concerns, which authors are encouraged to address to enhance the manuscript quality.
  - a) The information provided in the introduction part is not symmetric. It begins with the statement: Good diet and health habits positively affect students' academic performance (page 1, paragraph 1), leading to initiatives taken by the Minister of Education and Culture on May 2, 2012..... However, in the beginning, it lacks contextual detail, explaining the details of a healthy lifestyle, etc. As this study is conducted in the school context, therefore it is vital to discuss the health of the school pupils from the start of the manuscript.
  - b) Secondly, the citations provided by the authors are too old, taken from studies from 2005-2014. It's 2021, and there are too many studies published in prestigious journals regarding the study context
  - c) Third, the gap in the study is not properly identified. What is already known in the field? Why is there a need to conduct a review study?
  - d) There are many long sentences that are hard to understand. For instance,  
**Page 2:** *Developing the province of South Kalimantan towards the golden age must also address the abovementioned health issues among youngsters where some Developments are directly felt or enjoyed; whereas the majority are not, and this process involves developing habits and behavior, therefore it takes time for a society's culture to emerge.*

It is good to break such sentences into two or three sentences.

2. It is good to add the graphical presentation of the **South Kalimantan Province Population** in the form of a figure.
3. Also, add text detail for the data presented in the figure **Human Development Index 2010 -2017** for a better understanding of the readers.
4. It is also recommended to add separate detail in the form of a figure for **the amount of Positive HIV and AIDS Cases in South Kalimantan Province in 2017**.
5. The authors should explain **The Main Purpose of Physical Education** in the form of bullets by clearly explaining the physical education merits.
6. While explaining *Building a Healthy Culture Through Physical Education*, authors are encouraged to present the data in graphical form for the *Households with Clean and Healthy Lifestyle (PHBS) in South Kalimantan Province in 2017*.
7. Revise the conclusion to make it more influential and robust with key findings and implications rather than just providing the research summary.

It is also recommended that authors thoroughly proof added the whole document to avoid grammatical mistakes in all sections of the paper. The authors are also encouraged to take the help of native English speakers or a professional proof-editor to enhance the language quality of the paper.

#### **Reviewer B**

The topic of the paper is hot and relatively interesting. I have read the article with a lot of interest. Overall, this paper has some practical innovations and also discusses the findings. Based on this reading, I have provided some recommendations for improving the article:

- a. The author/authors seem not to be able to follow the practical problem orientation in the introduction section. They need to be clear about their motivation for this paper. Also, since the current study has been conducted among school students in the province of South Kalimantan, hence authors are encouraged to contextually explain the team and the significance of the study.
- b. I would recommend authors use figures in the form of maps to elaborate their point of view and statics related to the Human Development Index, The amount of Positive HIV and AIDS cases, The Percentage of Leprosy, etc.
- c. There is a need to explain in detail the purpose of physical education and Building a Healthy Culture Through Physical Education for readers' better understanding and to make the study more powerful in the area.
- d. Authors need to thoroughly discuss and elaborate on the Role of Physical Education Supervisors based on variable concepts in the area.
- e. The conclusion needs revision based on the implications and significance of the study while presenting a brief description of the study
- f. There are several grammatical mistakes in the please manuscript making it hard to understand. Therefore, it is recommended for authors to thoroughly read the whole manuscript, and it is better to avail the services of native English speakers to make the write-up clearer and easy to understand
- g. All the references should be formatted in APA 7th style, and also, authors are required to add the DOIs for all the references.

The paper can be resubmitted for a review after huge improvements and this does not guarantee it will be approved.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://jestp.com/index.php/estp/authorDashboard/submission/1636>

Username: sunarno

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

---

[Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice](#)

**[ESTP] Revision Submission Acknowledgement****Editor in Chief** <editor@jestp.com>

Tue, Mar 29, 2022 at 09:47 AM

To: **Sunarno Basuki** <sunarno.basuki@ulm.ac.id>

Sunarno Basuki:

Thank you for submitting revision of the manuscript, "THE ROLE OF THE PHYSICAL EDUCATION SUPERVISOR IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF HEALTHY CULTURE LIVING " to Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://jestp.com/index.php/estp/authorDashboard/submission/1636>

Username: sunarno

For our notes, we include your response to reviewer comments at the end of this automatic reply email.

If your paper pass reviews processes and meets our standards it is necessary to make the payment.

**Publication fee** (covers: publishing, review, and databases indexing costs): **1500 USD**.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

[Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice](#)

**Response to reviewer comments****Response To Reviewer-A**

No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	While reviewing the manuscript, <i>The Role of The Physical Education Supervisor in The Development of Healthy Culture Living for Elementary School Students</i> , I found that the authors have tried to address an important issue. Nonetheless, I still have some other concerns that should be further addressed to make the study more influential	Thanks very much, dear reviewer, for your kind remarks and for providing us with the opportunity to revise our manuscript. We are very grateful for all the valid and valuable comments. These helped us a lot to improve our work.
1.	The introduction part is not well written and arranged as per the objectives of the study. However, I have the following concerns, which authors are encouraged to address to enhance the manuscript quality. a). The information provided in the introduction part is not symmetric. It begins with the statement: Good diet and health habits positively affect students' academic performance (page 1, paragraph 1), leading to initiatives taken by the	Dear reviewer, we have revised the introduction by adding contextual information, i.e., by discussing the health of the school pupils and stating the clear gap per your kind comments and suggestion.

	<p>Minister of Education and Culture on May 2, 2012..... However, in the beginning, it lacks contextual detail, explaining the details of healthy lifestyle, etc. As this study is conducted in the school context, therefore it is vital to discuss the health of the school pupils from the start of the manuscript.</p> <p>b). Secondly, the citations provided by the authors are too old, taken from studies from 2005-2014. It's 2021, and there are too many studies published in prestigious journals regarding the study context</p> <p>c). Third, the gap in the study is not properly identified. What is already known in the field? Why is there a need to conduct a review study?</p> <p>d). There are many long sentences that are hard to understand. For instance,  <b>Page 2:</b> <i>Developing the province of South Kalimantan towards the golden age must also address the abovementioned health issues among youngsters where some Developments are directly felt or enjoyed, whereas the majority are not and this process involves developing habits and behavior, therefore it takes time for a society's culture to emerge.</i>  It is good to break such sentences into two or three sentences.</p>	<p>We have also updated the citations, mostly from 2019 to 2022</p> <p>Dear reviewers may, thanks for your kind suggestion. Following your kind instructions, we also have breakdown the long sentences into smaller ones which are now easy to understand by the readers</p> <p>Please see pages 1-11</p>
2.	<p>It is good to add the graphical presentation of the <b>South Kalimantan Province Population</b> in the form of a figure.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, Many thanks for your kind suggestions, and we have added Figure 1 as The South Kalimantan Province Population</p> <p>Please see page 4</p>
3	<p>Also, add text detail for the data presented in the figure <b>Human Development Index 2010 -2017</b> for a better understanding of the readers.</p>	<p>Respected reviewer, Thank you</p> <p>We have now explained the data presented in figure Human Development Index 2010 -2017 in detail.</p> <p>Please see pages number 5-6</p>
4	<p>It is also recommended to add separate detail in the form of a figure for <b>The amount of Positive HIV and AIDS Cases in South Kalimantan Province in 2017.</b></p>	<p>Respected reviewer, Many thanks for your kind suggestion. We have now added the figure presenting the data related to the amount of Positive HIV and AIDS Cases in South Kalimantan Province in 2017.</p> <p>Please see page 9</p>
5	<p>The authors should explain <b>The Main Purpose of Physical Education</b> in the form of bullets by clearly explaining the physical education merits.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, we are really grateful for this kind suggestion to enhance the quality of our manuscript. Following your kind guidelines, we have added The Main Purpose of Physical Education in the form of bullets by clearly explaining the physical education merits.</p> <p>Please see page no. 13</p>
6	<p>While explaining <b>Building a Healthy Culture Through Physical Education</b>, authors are encouraged to present the data in graphical form for the <b>Households with Clean and Healthy</b></p>	<p>Dear reviewer, Thank you. Following your kind guidelines, we added a graphical form for the Households with Clean and Healthy Lifestyle (PHBS) in South Kalimantan Province in 2017 as</p>

	<i>Lifestyle (PHBS) in South Kalimantan Province in 2017.</i>	Figure no 8.  Please see page no. 16
7	Revise the conclusion to make it more influential and robust with key findings and implications rather than just providing the research summary.	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind suggestion. We have revised the conclusion section per your kind guidelines by focusing on findings and implications and providing a brief research summary.  Please see page 21
8	It is also recommended that authors thoroughly proof added the whole document to avoid grammatical mistakes in all sections of the paper. The authors are also encouraged to take the help of native English speakers or professional proof-editors to enhance the language quality of the paper.	Dear reviewer, once again, many thanks for all your kind and valuable suggestions. We have thoroughly revised the whole manuscript with the help of professional proof-editors.

### Response To Reviewer-B

No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	The topic of the paper is hot and relatively interesting. I have read the article with a lot of interest. Overall, this paper has some practical innovations and also discusses the findings. Based on this reading, I have provided some recommendations for improving the article:	Thanks a lot, dear reviewer, for providing us with the opportunity to revise our manuscript. We are very grateful for all the valid and valuable comments. These helped us a lot to improve our work.
1.	The author/authors seem not to be able to follow the practical problem orientation in the introduction section. They need to be clear about their motivation for this paper. Also, since the current study has been conducted among school students in the province of South Kalimantan, hence authors are encouraged to contextually explain the team and the significance of the study.	Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind remarks. We have revised almost all parts of the paper as per the valuable comments provided by your kind, self-regarding contribution and, most importantly, focusing on the practical contribution of the paper in contextual settings. Please see pages 1-11  I hope your self will enjoy reading this version of the paper. Moreover, a detailed response to all the comments has been given as follows.
2.	I would recommend authors use figures in the form of maps to elaborate their point of view and statics related to the Human Development Index, The amount of Positive HIV and AIDS cases, The Percentage of Leprosy, etc.	Respected reviewer, Many thanks for your kind suggestions and guidelines. We have now added the maps and figures in support of the statistical data presented in the introduction section, more particularly related to the Human Development Index, The amount of Positive HIV and AIDS cases, The Percentage of Leprosy, etc. Please see pages 4-12
3	There is a need to explain in detail the purpose of physical education and Building a Healthy Culture Through Physical Education for readers' better understanding and to make the study more powerful in the area.	Respected reviewer, Thank you  We have now separately added the headings the purpose of physical education and Building a Healthy Culture Through Physical Education for readers' better understanding and to make the study more powerful in the area. Please see pages number 12-14
4	Authors need to thoroughly discuss and elaborate on the Role of Physical Education Supervisors	Dear reviewer, we are grateful for this kind suggestion to enhance the quality of our manuscript.

	based on variable concepts in the area.	Following your kind guidelines, we have thoroughly discussed the Role of Physical Education Supervisors based on variable concepts in the area.  Please see pages 17-19
5	The conclusion needs revision based on the implications and significance of the study while presenting a brief description of the study	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind suggestion. We have revised the conclusion section per your kind guidelines by focusing on findings and implications and providing a brief research summary.  Please see page 21
6	F. There are several grammatical mistakes in the please manuscript making it hard to understand. Therefore, it is recommended for authors to thoroughly read the whole manuscript, and it is better to avail the services of native English speakers to make the write-up clearer and easy to understand	Dear reviewer, we are grateful for your observations and for helping us enhance our manuscript's quality with your kind suggestions, comments, and guidelines. Following your kind guidelines, we have now proof-edited art paper with the help of professional native English speakers to enhance its quality and readability
7	G. All the references should be formatted in APA 7 <sup>th</sup> style, and also, authors are required to add the DOIs for all the references.	Dear reviewer, we have followed APA 7 <sup>th</sup> style and also added the DOIs for all the references following your kind suggestion

**[ESTP] Revision request****Editor in Chief** <editor@jestp.com>

Tue, Apr 26, 2022 at 11:33 AM

**To: Sunarno Basuki** <sunarno.basuki@ulm.ac.id>

Sunarno Basuki:

The paper "THE ROLE OF THE PHYSICAL EDUCATION SUPERVISOR IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF HEALTHY CULTURE LIVING " has been reviewed again.

Good improvements have been made to the paper. However, there are still minor improvements to be made.

Some considerations:

- 1). A small change has been made to the English version of your abstract.
- 2) There are still missing some DOI in the references (Bailey, R. (2006).; Ghanim, M., Dash, N., Abdullah, B., Issa, H., Albarazi, R., & Al Saheli, Z. (2016).; and Juniarti, N. (2017).).

The paper can be resubmitted for a review after huge improvements, and this does not guarantee it will be approved.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://jestp.com/index.php/estp/authorDashboard/submission/1636>

Username: sunarno

If your paper pass reviews processes and meets our standards it is necessary to make the payment.  
Publication fee (covers: publishing, review, and databases indexing costs): **1500 USD**.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

---

[Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice](#)

**[ESTP] Revision Submission Acknowledgement**

**Editor in Chief** <editor@jestp.com>

Fri, May 20, 2022 at 10:01 AM

**To: Sunarno Basuki** <sunarno.basuki@ulm.ac.id>

Sunarno Basuki:

Thank you for submitting revision of the manuscript, "THE ROLE OF THE PHYSICAL EDUCATION SUPERVISOR IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF HEALTHY CULTURE LIVING " to Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice.

With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Submission URL: <https://jestp.com/index.php/estp/authorDashboard/submission/1636>

Username: sunarno

If your paper pass reviews processes and meets our standards it is necessary to make the payment.

**Publication fee** (covers: publishing, review, and databases indexing costs): **1500 USD**.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor in Chief

---

[Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice](#)

**[ESTP] Acceptance Acknowledgment**

**Editor in Chief** <editor@jestp.com>

Thu, Jun 30, 2022 at 10:01 AM

**To: Sunarno Basuki** <sunarno.basuki@ulm.ac.id>

Sunarno Basuki:

Congratulations!

Your paper entitled, "THE ROLE OF THE PHYSICAL EDUCATION SUPERVISOR IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF HEALTHY CULTURE LIVING " has been accepted for publication in Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice (Vol. 22 No. 2, 2022).

Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on. We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

**Note:**

We will send you email separately for publication fee (covers: publishing, review, and databases indexing costs): **1500 USD**.

Editor in Chief

---

[Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice](#)